

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd

Lleoliad:
Ystafell Bwyllgora 3 - Y Senedd

Dyddiad:
Dydd Iau, 3 Tachwedd 2011

Amser:
09:30

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



I gael rhagor o wybodaeth, cysylltwch a:

Virginia Hawkins
Clerc y Pwyllgor
029 2089 8544
ES.comm@wales.gov.uk

Agenda

1. Cyflwyniadau, ymddiheuriadau a dirprwyon

2. Ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru - Tystiolaeth gan gwmnïau ynni - Ystyried ynni adnewyddadwy (09.30 - 10.30)

(Tudalennau 1 - 23)

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 1 – SWALEC / SSE

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 2 - RWE npower ac npower renewables

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 3 – Scottish Power

Sam Peacock, Pennaeth Materion Cyhoeddus, SSE
Simon Wells, Pennaeth Cyfraith Cynllunio ac Amgylcheddol, RWE npower
Wayne Cranstone, Cyfarwyddwr Datblygiad a Prosiectau, npower renewables
Janice McLaughlin, Cyfarwyddwr Prosiect – Cymru a Lloegr, Scottish Power
Renewables

3. Ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru - Tystiolaeth gan gwmnïau ynni a'r Grid Cenedlaethol - Ystyried materion yn ymwneud â rhwydwaith a'r grid (10.30 - 11.30) (Tudalennau 24 - 34)

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 2 - RWE npower ac npower renewables

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 3 – Scottish Power

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 4 – Y Grid Cenedlaethol

Simon Wells, Pennaeth Cyfraith Cynllunio ac Amgylcheddol, RWE npower
Wayne Cranstone, Cyfarwyddwr Datblygiad a Prosiectau, npower renewables
Colin Taylor, Pennaeth Dynlunio, Rhwydweithiau Ynni Scottish Power

Steve Knight-Gregson, Arbennigwr Pennaf dros Brosiectau Fawr, Y Grid
Cenedlaethol

4. Papurau i'w nodi (Tudalennau 35 - 62)

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 5

Gohebiaeth gan Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy ynghylch ceisiadau am brosiectau ynni dros 50MW ac o dan 50MW

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 6

Gohebiaeth gan y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd ynghylch camau gweithredu sy'n deillio o gyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar 19 Gorffennaf

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 7

Gohebiaeth gan y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd ynghylch camau gweithredu sy'n deillio o gyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar 13 Hydref ynghylch cyllideb ddrafft 2012-13

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 8

Blaenraglen waith y Pwyllgor – hydref 2011

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 1

Ymchwiliad i Bolisi Ynni a Chynllunio yng Nghymru – Tystiolaeth gan SWALEC / SSE



Ymateb SWALEC / SSE i ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd i bolisi a chynllunio ynni yng Nghymru

SWALEC oedd y prif gyflenwr trydan yn Ne Cymru cyn preifateiddio ac mae gan y cwmni dros ddeugain o flynyddoedd o ymrwymiad i Gymru. Heddiw, SSE a adnabuwyd yn gynt fel Scottish and Southern Energy, yw rhiant-gwmni SWALEC.

SSE yw'r cyflenwr ynni mwyaf ond un yn y DU, a'r cynhyrchedd mwyaf o ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae SSE yn seiliedig yn y DU ac yn cyflogi tua 20,000 o bobl yn y DU, a dylid nodi y cafwyd 5,000 o'r rheiny eu recriwtio dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

Dros y blynyddoedd diweddar mae SWALEC / SSE wedi bod yn cynyddu ei gweithgareddau yng Nghymru. Yn 2009 prynodd SSE gorsaf bŵer Aber-wysg yn agos at Gasnewydd, ac mae SSE yn ddiweddar wedi cael caniatâd i adeiladu gorsaf bŵer nwy sylweddol ym Maglan. Yn ogystal â hyn mae gan SSE uchelgais i adeiladu fferm wynt yng Nghanolbarth Cymru, er bod y prosiect hwn yn wynebu rhai anawsterau ar hyn o bryd.

Mae SWALEC wedi cynyddu'r nifer o bobl a gyflogir yng Nghymru dros y blynyddoedd diweddar ac mae'r cwmni yn awr yn cyflogi dros 2,000 o bobl. Mae'r mwyafrif o'r rhain yn gweithio o ddau ganolfan yng Nghaerdydd sydd yn delio â chasgliadau a pherthnasau cyflenwi busnes i fusnes. Dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf mae SWALEC wedi recriwtio dros 800 o aelodau newydd o staff yng Nghymru gan arddangos ein hymrwymiad i'r wlad.

Mae gan SWALEC gynlluniau i sefydlu Canolfan Ynni Smart (Smart Energy) yng Nghymru i ymddwyn fel canolfan weithredu a hyfforddiant ar gyfer ein tîm Gwasanaethau Cartref, ein braich Contractio, ein gwasanaeth Mesuro a sefydliad dau fusnes newydd yng Nghymru i ganolbwyntio ar ficrogynhyrchu ac Inswleiddiad Wal Solet. Gall hyn greu 250 o swyddi gwyrdd newydd â chyflogau da mewn ardal gydgyfeirio o Gymru, ond mae'n ddibynnol ar gefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru a phenderfyniad terfynol gan Fwrdd SSE.

Beth yw'r goblygiadau i Gymru pe bai'r cyfrifoldeb ar gyfer cydsynio prif brosiectau isadeiledd ynni atraeth ac alltraeth yn aros yn fater i Lywodraeth y DU?

Mae'r UE wedi cyfrifo bod angen buddsoddi 1 triliwn Euro yn y sector dros y degawd nesaf er mwyn cwrdd â'r tair elfen o'r strategaeth Ewropeaidd i sicrhau diogelwch cyflenwi ynni, parchu targedau allyriadau carbon a diogelu awydd yr UE i gystadlu. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi cyfrifo y bydd angen gwario £200 biliwn yn y DU yn unig.

Mae mantolenni'r diwydiant ynni yn cael eu hymestyn yn barod; fodd bynnag, mae ein cwmni ni er enghraifft yn buddsoddi dros £1.5 biliwn y flwyddyn ar gynlluniau cynhyrchu. Fodd bynnag, gyda banciau yn llai parod i fenthyg, mae cyfleustodau yn dod yn fwy a mwy ymwybodol o'r angen i sicrhau eu bod yn buddsoddi yn y pethau iawn.

Mae nifer o lefydd ar draws y byd yn cystadlu ar gyfer y buddsoddiad hwn. Mae'r buddsoddiad felly yn fwy tebygol o fynd i ble y gall cwmnïau ddisgwyl fframwaith polisi syml a chyson.

Mae gan SSE berthynas iachus iawn gyda'r Adran Newid Hinsawdd yn Llundain a'r IPC sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gyfrifol am ganiatáu prif isadeiledd ynni atraeth ac alltraeth. Dylid nodi bod ynni yn bortffolio cymhleth iawn ac iddi adnoddau da yn Llundain.

Mae profiad diweddar SSE o ran datblygiad ein fferm wynt arfaethedig yng Nghanolbarth Cymru wedi achosi llawer o bryder o fewn y cwmni gan fod canfyddiad bod y termau a drafodwyd yn flaenorol ar gyfer isadeiledd y grid yng Nghanolbarth Cymru gan Lywodraeth Cymru wedi eu newid.

Pe bai Llywodraeth Cymru yn dymuno cynyddu ei chyfrifoldebau sydd yn perthyn i ynni bydd angen arbenigedd ychwanegol sylweddol. Gall y lefel o arbenigedd technegol sydd angen o ran deall sut y mae isadeiledd grid yn gweithio a'r agweddau technegol o sut i gysylltu ffermydd gwynt er enghraifft, gyfiawnhau'r defnydd o gynghorwyr allanol. Mae'r adnoddau ar gyfer polisi ynni Llywodraeth Cymru yn gyfyngedig iawn.

Er na fydd SSE yn gwneud sylwadau penodol ar faterion cyfansoddiadol, mae'n glir y bydd unrhyw newid yn gorfod cynnwys newid adnoddau o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n ymddangos o ddatganiadau diweddar gan Lywodraeth y DU bod newidiadau yn y dyfodol agos yn annhebygol. Mae'n hanfodol felly bod cydweithio a chytundeb agosach rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU, yn ogystal â chysondeb yn y ffordd o ymdrin â buddsoddiad ynni tymor canolog a hir dymor yng Nghymru. Heb hyn, mae'n debygol y bydd buddsoddiad ynni yng Nghymru yn lleihau.

Gydag isadeiledd ynni, mae cwmnïau yn buddsoddi dros gyfnodau o ugain mlynedd (o leiaf). Mae angen sicrwydd ar gyfer y math hwn o fuddsoddiad. Rhaid ystyried hyn wrth wneud unrhyw newidiadau o ran proses a chyfrifoldeb neu mae perygl o yrru buddsoddiad i ffwrdd o Gymru.

Sut y mae hyn yn effeithio ar gyflawni dyheadau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer ffurfiau amrywiol o ynni adnewyddadwy a charbon isel yn ôl y Datganiad Polisi Ynni?

Mae nifer helaeth o adnoddau sydd yn addas i'w defnyddio ar gyfer y pwrpas o gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Mae'r ddogfen Chwyldro Ynni Carbon Isel a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn 2011 yn arddangos hyn yn glir. Nid yw'r ddogfen hon fodd bynnag, yn ystyried y ffaith bod angen i'r cwmnïau sydd yn debygol o fuddsoddi wneud enillion masnachol ar eu buddsoddiad a bod cystadleuaeth ffyrnig ar gyfer y buddsoddiad hwn.

Nid oedd y dyheadau ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yn ystyried beth oedd yn digwydd ar hyd a lled y DU. Mae'r potensial ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni tonnau a llanw er enghraifft, wedi'i osod yn uwch na tharged y DU, ac nid oedd yn ystyried y ffaith bod cyflwr y tonnau a'r llanw yn well yn yr Alban ar gyfer y math hwn o ddatblygiad, a hefyd bod cymhellion gwell i gwmnïau fuddsoddi yno.

Sut y mae hyn yn effeithio ar gyflawni targed Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer lleihad o 3 y cant y flwyddyn mewn allyriadau Nwyon Tŷ Gwydr o 2011?

Mae'r lleihad arfaethedig mewn allyriadau Nwyon Tŷ Gwydr yn gyfyngedig i feysydd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Mae gan y Llywodraeth yr offer i wneud newidiadau mewn ysgolion, ysbytai a.a. a dylai'r prif ffocws fod ar effeithlonrwydd ynni. Nid oes unrhyw reswm pam na ddylai'r targedau hyn gael eu cyflawni, er y bydd menter talu-er-mwyn-arbed gyda ffocws gwell o bosib yn fwy priodol.

Gall Llywodraeth Cymru hefyd gymryd rôl mwy arweiniol o ran trafndiaeth er enghraifft, drwy fynnu bod pob corff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru sydd yn derbyn ariannu ar gyfer cerbydau yn sicrhau bod canran o'r cerbydau hyn yn drydanol. Pe bai hyn yn digwydd, gall Cymru gael ei sefydlu fel prif symudwr er mwyn adeiladu rhywfaint o ddiwydiant ac isadeiledd o'i chwmpas. Byddai'n lleihau allyriadau carbon o gerbydau'r sector cyhoeddus, yn lleihau'r arian sy'n cael ei wario ar betrol ac o bosib yn ysgogi diwydiant newydd yng Nghymru.

Beth fydd yr effaith pe na chaiff penderfyniadau caniatâd ar brosiectau isadeiledd mawr a datblygiadau sy'n perthyn eu gwneud yn ôl polisi cynllunio Cymru?

Mae'n fwy cymhleth yn barod mewn rhai amgylchiadau i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru nag yn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Mae hyn oherwydd bod rhai agweddau o'r polisi cynllunio yn barod wedi eu datganoli i Gymru ac yna i awdurdodau lleol. Mae Cymru felly yn dal i reoli rhai agweddau o gynllunio sydd yn perthyn i ddatblygiadau isadeiledd mawr, tra bod yr IPC/DECC yn rheoli'r prif benderfyniadau caniatâd.

Arddangosir hyn orau drwy ein profiad diweddar i geisio datblygu fferm wynt yn Nant y Moch yng Nghanolbarth Cymru. Gellid torri lawr y cais cynllunio yn y ffordd ganlynol. Bydd angen cydsynio'r ceisiadau unigol i gyd er mwyn i'r prosiect barhau.

<u>Prosiect</u>	<u>Cais gan</u>	<u>Corff</u>
<u>Cydsynio</u>		
Fferm Wynt	- SSE i gyflwyno	IPC
Gwifrau o fferm wynt i is-orsaf	- SSE i gyflwyno	IPC
Prif grid / gwifrau newydd	- Grid Cenedlaethol i gyflwyno	IPC
Is-orsaf Awdurdod Lleol.	- Grid Cenedlaethol i gyflwyno	

Yn Lloegr bydd hyn i gyd yn cael ei ystyried gan yr IPC, yn yr Alban bydd hyn i gyd yn cael ei ystyried gan Lywodraeth yr Alban. Yng Nghymru mae mecanweithiau mwy cymhleth sydd yn gallu arwain at ymdrîn â phethau mewn ffordd anghyson.

Byd datblygwyr yn y dyfodol yn amharod i fuddsoddi mewn gwlad ble mae brwydr gyfansoddiadol am ble ddylai'r pwerau orwedd yn cael ei hymladd ar eu prosiectau - gyda datblygwyr yn ei chanol.

Environment and Sustainability Committee

E&S(4)-08-11 paper 2

Inquiry into Energy Policy and Planning in Wales – Evidence from RWE npower and npower renewables

Submission from RWE npower and npower renewables

This submission is from RWE npower and RWE npower renewables, part of the RWE group, a German owned energy business, generating electricity and supplying gas, electricity and related services to customers across the UK through RWE npower and renewable energy through RWE npower renewables. We are one of the largest inward investors in Wales where our current portfolio comprises a large coal-fired power station, two combined heat and power plants and numerous renewable energy schemes including both onshore and offshore wind and hydro generation. We are also a 50 per cent shareholder (with E.ON UK) in Horizon Nuclear Power to develop the option to build and operate a new nuclear power station at Wylfa. This would represent an investment of around £8bn. Other investments include:

- construction of Gwynt y Môr Offshore Wind Farm (circa £2bn)
- construction of a new high efficiency gas fired power station at Pembroke (circa £1bn)
- development of the proposed Atlantic Array offshore wind farm (circa £4.5bn)
- development of a demonstration array of tidal stream turbines off the Anglesey coast.

In total, our current Welsh capacity represents around a third of the electricity consumed in Wales and, equally important, our investments create local employment opportunities, economy and community benefits. We currently have over 350 employees based in Wales. Where feasible we will recruit and train people from the local community and to procure services locally.

You may be aware that we are awaiting the determination of the application for an environmental permit to commission and operate the new CCGT power station at Pembroke, and that the Environment Agency Wales have been directed not to determine the application by the Welsh Government. Given the ongoing nature of this process we have judged it inappropriate to consider this case in this submission.

In our submission we have summarised our view of the role that the Welsh Government has in relation to major infrastructure investments and then answered the specific questions raised in the invitation for submissions.

Overview of the role of the Welsh Government (WG) and the regulatory regime from an investors perspective

A coherent UK Energy policy is currently the responsibility of Westminster although WG has a key role in the implementation of such policy in Wales. It

is that policy framework that will establish the incentive to invest in the UK energy infrastructure. Where those opportunities to invest are located in Wales then WG have a key role in scrutiny and facilitating delivery. With WG's responsibility for planning, economic development and the environment there is significant scope for influence.

It is inevitable that devolution complicates the process of investing in Wales, with an increase in the number of government departments, regulatory bodies and NGOs involved. This additional complexity should not, however, be a barrier provided that there is sufficient consistency and co-operation throughout the process. Whilst we would agree that all bodies need to preserve a level of independence and transparency, this must not detract from the ability to co-operate and should avoid unnecessary workload, bureaucracy or delays.

We feel it is important to recognise that decisions about investment within large companies like RWE have to balance investment resources against other factors such as the predictability and complexity of planning and regulatory frameworks. To succeed in attracting RWE investment, Wales has to compete effectively in a European (if not global) market. In particular, given the current economic circumstances our UK businesses have to convince our parent company, RWE AG, that projects in Wales will provide a better return than alternative projects across Europe, that they can be delivered on time and provide the expected returns in order that those assets can then operate as part of a balanced generation portfolio.

The key condition for us is a stable and predictable regulatory regime that provides us with the confidence to make the case to invest in Wales. We need to be able to deliver projects on time and to budget with no surprises or unnecessary delays that erode the confidence of our parent company. Experience gained in any country will influence the level of country risk that investors build into future investment appraisal calculations.

We need to be able to work UK Government, Welsh national, regional and local government and Wales's regulatory agencies in a constructive, transparent, predictable and efficient way to develop plans and deliver them.

An example of good practice in this area is the Anglesey Energy Island programme. The programme brings together all of these groups through a number of workstreams relevant to the bringing forward of low carbon energy projects on Anglesey and North Wales, for example supply chain and skills development, consents and infrastructure, and policy alignment. The programme ensures proper co-ordinated scrutiny is given to projects such as the new Wylfa nuclear power station, whilst at the same time removing unnecessary barriers to development and investment.

However, whilst we accept that major infrastructure projects must be properly assessed to ensure no unintended consequences, we have also experienced additional work load and project delays due to poorly managed interfaces between environmental agencies. We will closely follow proposals for the merger of Environment Agency (EA) Wales, CCW and Forestry Commission Wales. This implies a greater separation of EA Wales from the EA in England

and would be detrimental to Wales if this led to greater complexity through the adoption of different approaches across the UK.

As a major investor in energy infrastructure we need to have confidence that high value complex projects can be planned, consented, built and permitted in a competent, well managed way. Our recent onshore wind experience with local planning and Public Inquiry in Wales (see examples later) does not provide the confidence, at this time, to support the transfer of further energy powers to WG. This view is unlikely to change until we can see a track record of such projects consistently being delivered in a reliable, timely and competent manner. WG also need to publicly support and implement existing policy and intervene where projects which support policy are not being progressed effectively at local level.

Specific questions raised by the Committee.

How the current devolution arrangements for energy policy and planning affect the delivery of the desired future energy mix.

We support the current arrangements for projects above 50MW and welcome the proposed changes to the planning process. It is now important, however, for that process to deliver.

For projects under 50 MW we have concerns that the planning process in Wales is slow and unpredictable compared to competing countries. There are frustrations regarding the political will, skills and resources available in Wales to focus on timely delivery of projects.

What are the implications for Wales if responsibility for consenting major onshore and offshore energy infrastructure projects remain with UK Gov?

The IPC and its successor will continue to consider and determine applications with WG's involvement and in line with the NPS' developed with WG's involvement. It seems unlikely, therefore, that any scheme located in Wales could be consented if there are justifiable concerns that have not been addressed. We welcome the involvement of Welsh Commissioners in this process providing that there are sufficient resources allocated to avoid unnecessary delays to the process.

From a developers perspective our concern lies not in who has responsibility for decision making but in the level of confidence we have in their ability to manage the process professionally, setting out process and timescales and adhering to them so all parties have common expectations.

The large Round 3 offshore wind project in the Bristol Channel, Atlantic Array (1500MW) is being developed by RWE npower renewables. This project sits mainly in English waters but some of the turbines, potentially up to 20%, may ultimately be in Welsh waters. Under the current system with the IPC/ UK Government roles, the process for consenting of this project is relatively straightforward with one body running the process. If the division between

English and Welsh waters introduced the need to go to two separate consenting authorities this would not be helpful.

How does this affect achievement of WG's aspirations for various forms of renewable and low carbon energy?

Leaving the major infrastructure consenting with UK Government will continue to deliver large scale energy projects in Wales in consultation with WG.

Welsh authorities need to focus on determining planning applications for projects under 50MW in accordance with policy and in a timely manner in order that progress can be made towards WG aspirations. It is through genuine commitment to achieving the Welsh Government's own TAN 8 targets that the wind industry will build up its confidence in Wales.

The Mid Wales and Anglesey transmission upgrades also need progressing as a priority.

To deliver new renewable electricity generation and the associated socio-economic benefits, we require Welsh Government (WG) officials to work with industry representatives over coming months to deliver on a range of issues as set out below (further details in Appendix 1):

- Production of clearly defined renewable electricity targets
- Clarity over TAN 8 targets
- Acceptance of the need and visible support for Mid Wales grid upgrade
- Co-ordination of Mid Wales transport and access policy
- Support for the supply chain and provision of facilities
- Resources for Local Planning
- Stimulus for marine

How does it affect delivery of WG's target of 3% p.a. reduction in GHG emissions from 2011?

The 3% p.a. reduction in GHG is from non traded sectors so is not impacted by consenting decisions for major electricity generating schemes that emit GHG. Hence it is not apparent to us how the transfer of energy policy powers from Westminster to WG would have any significant impact on the delivery of this target.

What will be the impact if consenting decisions on major infrastructure projects are not taken in accordance with Welsh planning policy?

Given both the involvement that Welsh authorities will have in major infrastructure consents affecting Wales, and that Welsh planning policy is likely to be compatible with UK energy policy, it seems unlikely that there would be significant consequences. The NPS recognises Welsh policy and decisions will have to be made giving due regard to Welsh policy. If consents don't fully reflect Welsh planning policy, there will be opportunities for the projects to be challenged at a later stage which will result in additional cost and delay to developers and failure to reach low carbon energy aspirations in Wales.

The role of different consenting agencies

Potential investors need a consenting and permitting process that is competently managed, coherent and delivered in a timely and effective manner to provide confidence in progressing investment decisions.

Uncertainty in timescales

At present, developers are exposed to an open ended process for obtaining consents and permits. In respect of permits if the environmental regulator seeks an extension to statutory timescales (which is quite normal) other than agreeing, the only alternative available to the developer is to withdraw the application and appeal to the Secretary of State.

We respect the independent nature of the decision making processes and agree the EA needs to come to robust conclusions but there is a need to explore ways of reducing the uncertainty in timescales.

It is essential that statutory bodies and regulators are sufficiently resourced, experienced and competent to expedite the consultations.

A more contractual approach with clear obligations on parties to adhere to programme and financial compensation if parties default may encourage more thought up front on what needs to be done and how long it will take – but care would have to be taken not to undermine the independence of the decision making process.

Ability of parties to frustrate the process

It is apparent that parties opposed to proposals can frustrate the processes by not adhering to consultation timescales and drip feeding information to regulators that they then feel compelled to consider. This soaks up time and resources and prevents progress in reasonable timescales. We hope that this will improve as the Planning Act (as amended by the Localism Bill) takes full effect.

Obligations on parties to submit evidence within agreed timescales and avoid “drip feeding” information should still allow interested parties to participate in a well managed process and raise valid issues or objections, but remove the ability to frustrate the process. We believe that ways need to be found that discourage interested parties from presenting “new” evidence after set deadlines - one possibility could be deferring the consideration of “new” evidence until the relevant consent or permit is next open for review.

Repeated effort going over same ground at different stages

Staged applications should allow evidence to be considered and decisions made in a progressive manner such that any significant or controversial issues can be identified and considered early, thus either saving effort if they cannot be overcome or making a useful contribution to the process by reaching early conclusions if they can be resolved. It should not be necessary to revisit decisions at later stages in a well managed staged approach unless genuinely new information is revealed that justifies such a review. Recent experience, however, has proved that this is not always the case and therefore the benefits of work in the early stages can be lost. We need to

establish how we can make it possible to create a progressive process that builds information and evidence, does not revisit decisions once they have been made, avoids backtracking or replicating effort and reduces potential for surprises later in the process.

If a staged approach cannot be made to work effectively then another possible option is a regime which allows both the consent and the environmental permit to be concluded at the same time as proposed in the NPS's, within agreed time limits. This approach also presents difficulties, specifically in gaining sufficiently robust information from plant suppliers to allow the permit conditions to be resolved satisfactorily. As we would not have placed a contract, it would be difficult to deal with different suppliers' plant configurations and performance characteristics. Equally it would be problematic to expect plant suppliers to provide reliable information before they know they have been selected for the work. There could also be a considerable time lag between construction consent and operational commencement where an operational permit is obtained a significant time in advance of operation. It should be considered whether a permit be constructed to allow for these circumstances

There is merit in giving the developer the option to choose which permitting route is the most suitable for each project; consent and permit at the same time, a staged approach or sequential consenting and permitting.

Associated Development

Another area which has the potential to result in different views and approaches is in the area of infrastructure planning and Associated Development as governed by the Planning Act 2008. In England, Associated Development can be considered by the IPC as part of an application for a Development Consent Order. In Wales, however, given the impact of the Devolution Settlement, the nature of Associated Development is much more limited, thereby requiring developers to make different applications to a variety of different bodies in respect of a significant infrastructure project. This means that aspects of nationally significant infrastructure projects (eg the substation for the Mid Wales grid upgrade) do not benefit from the accelerated timescales and streamlined process that have been adopted specifically for nationally significant infrastructure projects. There is the potential for this application to 'get stuck' in the planning system and it may be appropriate, in circumstances such as these, for WAG to consider using its "call-in" powers.

We need a consistent and co-ordinated process across UK Government and devolved administrations that avoid conflicting views and approaches that could disrupt a process that, for energy infrastructure projects, starts in Westminster and ends with a regulatory regime that is the responsibility of a devolved administration.

Permit review

We need to bear in mind that the environmental regulators have the powers to review permits at any time. If the regulator decides to review a permit the only challenge lies if we are not satisfied it was carried in accordance with due process. This could, however, allow permits to be granted early in the

process and reviewed later if changes to plant design or performance change to such an extent that a review would be appropriate.

Environment Agency and Countryside Council for Wales

We have experienced significant difficulties and uncertainty arising from the interaction between the EA and the Countryside Council for Wales. The impact of this kind of issue on investment confidence should not be underestimated

Their precise roles and relationship need to be clarified.

Amalgamating the two bodies could help to reduce the difficulties. We would, however, like to understand more detail of what the new body would look like, the scope of its duties, mode of operation etc. If they do merge then a clear process should be in place to minimise any potential delays due to ill defined roles within the new body.

We would also need to understand how the change would affect the complexity of the environmental regulatory regime across the UK.

The relationship between UK NPS's and Wales planning policies

We believe that the UK NPS's and Welsh Planning Policies are compatible. Both documents aim to deliver low carbon energy against relevant targets. We acknowledge that the NPSs require the IPC to have regard to Welsh AG policy and that it expects applicants to take them into account when submitting proposals.

The potential for renewables to meet WG's aspirations for generation and GHG emission reductions

Wales has a challenging target of achieving 22.5GW of renewable energy by 2025. The renewables sector is already injecting some £160m into the Welsh economy and, if significant projects are built, it is estimated to be contributing in the region of £1b to the Welsh GDP by 2020.

The Gwynt y Môr Offshore Wind Farm is currently under construction with the onshore electrical substation and cabling well advanced and offshore construction starting in the Autumn and scheduled to run for 3 years to 2014. Some key contributions Gwynt y Môr makes to Wales:

- Wales largest renewable project;
- Has already provided over £20m in construction contracts to local North Wales firms;
- Employment during construction;
- Some 90 full time staff will be employed to operate the project, most of whom will be based at our operations base at Mostyn Port.

RWE NRL is a key company in helping to deliver the targets and already contributes about half of Wales' renewable energy generation (314MW) with some 2487MW of projects currently in planning or going through consultation. Our projects are typically taking over 3 years to progress through the local planning process with only 7 turbines consented in 7 years.

Wales will continue to miss its renewable energy targets and the associated economic benefits unless projects are consented and built. The following issues need resolving quickly to stand a chance of achieving this:

1. Developers and investors must have confidence in a clear, transparent, competent and efficient planning process in Wales in order to successfully

Example:

Mynydd y Gwair Wind Farm (40MW)– This site sits within Strategic Search Area E. A planning application was made to The City and County of Swansea in September 2008 and one year later in October 2009 an appeal was lodged against the failure of the Council to progress and determine the application.

A Public Inquiry was held to examine the appeal during July and August 2010 and a decision was made by the Welsh Ministers in February 2011, to dismiss the appeal and the Common Land Exchange Orders. The reasons cited for dismissing the appeal related to the impact of the proposal upon peatland ecology and the location and management arrangements associated with the land to be exchanged into the Common.

Having reviewed the minister's decision, RWE NRL believed that the conclusions reached by the Inspector at the Public Inquiry were flawed, in that the conclusions did not follow clearly and logically from the evidence presented at the inquiry. As a result, RWE NRL challenged the Inspectors report.

In July, 2011, a High Court Judge announced that he had upheld our challenge against the Inspectors report, meaning that the planning application will potentially go back to public inquiry for redetermination. The High Court did not uphold our challenge over the refusal to grant Common Land consent.

WG have since challenged the High Court decision and we are waiting to see if they are granted leave to be heard in the Court of Appeal. The project remains in the legal process with no date for resolution. This is frustrating as this wind farm is within a SSA and could have made an important contribution to 2010 targets that WG failed to meet.

progress projects.

2. WG must provide robust, clear support for renewables in order to retain the interest of investors and encourage the development of the supply chain which is essential to the success of the renewables sector and the Welsh economy. WG must also monitor progress towards delivering its own policies and actively intervene where necessary to impress on local authorities the importance of meeting targets and delivering renewable energy

Example:

Fforch Nest Wind Farm (25MW)– This site straddles the boundaries between Bridgend County Borough Council and Rhondda Cynon Taf and lies in Strategic Search Area F. The Planning applications were submitted in 2006, with supplementary Environmental Information submitted by RWE NRL in 2008. In 2009, Bridgend resolved to approve their application and planning permission was issued in 2011 (the delay was due to s106's). Bridgend had to resolve some difficult issues posed by having 2 competing schemes in close proximity yet they still manage to determine this application nearly 2 years before RCT determined theirs. The remainder of the site in Rhondda Cynon Taf was finally refused at Committee in February 2011 and RWE NRL have appealed this decision. A Public Inquiry will start in October 2011.

3. Grid issues in Mid Wales must be resolved to allow projects to be progressed through planning and to ensure that projects can be built and can connect to the grid

4. The Mid Wales access issue must be resolved to allow projects to progress through planning and construction.

5. Where projects are to be determined by DECC, on occasions we have found input from Local Authorities in Wales is not forthcoming and has prevented DECC from determining projects.

Example:

Carnedd Wen Onshore Wind Farm (150MW) –Section 36 application was submitted to DECC in 2008 but Powys County Council are reluctant to provide a 'Form B response' until grid and access issues are resolved in Mid Wales. The project can not be progressed but has the potential to make a significant contribution towards the onshore wind target of 430MW in SSA B.

This is just one of 16 proposed wind farms in Mid Wales that are in planning but that could contribute up to 1.4GW towards Wales' target of 2GW by 2015

The potential role for other forms of energy production - e.g fossil, nuclear, coal-bed methane and shale gas

Mitigating climate change is a fundamental element of national and international energy policy. Massive investment is required in low carbon sources of energy.

Wylfa on Anglesey is one of the UK's best sites for a potential new nuclear power station. It is a large, hard rock site with good infrastructure, an established nuclear skill base and supply chain and widespread local public support.

A new nuclear power station at Wylfa would deliver up to 3.3GW of baseload low carbon energy. On a levelised cost basis nuclear is at least as affordable as the other providers of major low carbon energy.

We anticipate the new station would provide around 5,000 direct jobs during the construction phase, and around 800 high quality permanent jobs for at least two generations during operation. Detailed socio-economic studies are being prepared as part of a consent application we aim to submit in 2013, but the benefit from demand for goods and services from the local community is likely to run into the tens of millions during operation and hundreds of millions during construction. The project is highly complex and long term and involves a range of associated developments alongside the main site. This requires close co-ordination with Welsh and UK Government and Agencies. The Anglesey Energy Island Concept provides a strong platform for early sharing of consistent information, identification of issues and co-ordination. It also enables us to ensure a joined up approach to strategies for the development of the local supply chain and skills pipeline.

Major low carbon projects, will inevitably take some time to be delivered. In the transitional phase there will still be reliance on fossil based energy to provide secure low cost supplies and technologies such as carbon capture and storage are being developed to provide a place for fossil fuels in the future energy mix.

RWE npower's Aberthaw power station, designed to burn South Wales coal, plays a key role in the energy mix and supports local economy by a contribution of over £75m to the Welsh economy per year. As the energy mix progressively comprises intermittent wind and baseload nuclear generation it will be the fossil plant that provides the secure load following capability. This flexible generation role will initially be carried out by existing coal and gas plant which will gradually be replaced by affordable new low carbon flexible plant options.

Our soon to be commissioned £1bn Pembroke power station is the most efficient CCGT in the UK and although its early generation will be baseload it will at some stage be required to provide the flexible demand following generation that wind and nuclear are not suited. Based on our experience of other operational CCGT's an annual impact on the local economy of around £10 million is expected. The plant will create around 80-100 long-term high-quality jobs.

Nuclear is a tried and tested base load low carbon technology but its deployment is to a large extent influenced by public acceptance. Delivering a nuclear new build programme remains central to plans to decarbonise electricity supplies in the UK. Wylfa is our lead new build nuclear site with potential for 3.2-3.3GW.

Appendix 1

Key action areas for achievement of WG's aspirations for various forms of renewable energy

- Production of clearly defined renewable electricity targets - Clear targets are needed for delivery, including publication of the "Energy Route Map" as the signal to industry and infrastructure, to gear up for the future.
- Clarity over TAN 8 targets: despite the Ministerial Clarification letter from John Griffiths to local planning authorities in July 2011, there is still confusion about whether the indicative capacities identified in TAN8 for each SSA can be exceeded or are maximums.
- Acceptance of the need and visible support for Mid Wales grid upgrade - Grid upgrade is essential for the export of Mid Wales energy, to meet 2020 targets. National Grid has completed its consultation on line routing options and the optimum location for a Mid Wales substation. Announcement of the location of the new Mid Wales substation is expected in Autumn 2011. The planning application for the substation, a strategically important infrastructure project is to be decided by Powys County Council. Appropriate resource should be allocated to dealing with this application in a timely and efficient manner.
- Co-ordination of Mid Wales transport and access policy - Due to the close proximity of SSAs B, C and D there are likely to be significant numbers of abnormal loads moving through similar areas in Mid Wales. This is a cumulative issue for all developers that needs to be managed at a strategic level to limit the impacts on public amenity, tourism and all road users. The full support of key stakeholders, especially WG and Welsh Police forces, is essential if we are to achieve and deliver an industry led solution to managing transport and access.
- Support for the supply chain - For Welsh industry to take advantage of the major infrastructure and manufacturing opportunities, this will require public support from WG for renewable energy and a commitment to address existing barriers to development including planning delays and access to grant aid. In essence, without planning permission being issued, there will be significantly reduced opportunities for Welsh businesses.
- Provision of facilities - RWE npower renewables is proposing to develop a project of up to 1500MW in the outer Bristol Channel, known as Atlantic Array Offshore Wind Farm. The offshore wind farm industry presents a great opportunity for the UK supply chain and we have been working with The Crown Estate to hold a number of supply chain events for UK companies. The events aim to provide advance project information to the local supply chain and support businesses to be well equipped to tender for relevant contracts within the renewable energy sector. Any support provided by WG for these businesses would be welcomed.

- Resources for Local Planning Authorities - Support is required to enable LPAs to manage wind farm applications in a timely and effective manner in order to deliver on renewable energy targets. We recommend that WG continue to make additional resources available to enable LPAs to make decisions on projects within a reasonable timeframe.
- Stimulus for marine - The current revenue support mechanism in Wales is not sufficient to make tidal stream and wave technologies an attractive investment for commercial projects. Wave and tidal technologies are far less mature commercially than wind technology, and are therefore a more expensive and risky investment. WG must review the capital grants and revenue support mechanisms currently available to make them more attractive to developers to enable a balanced mix of generation technologies to be deployed and to harness more of Wales' natural energy resources.

Environment and Sustainability Committee

E&S(4)-08-11 paper 3

Inquiry into Energy Policy and Planning in Wales - Evidence from
Scottish Power Limited

Introduction

1. This evidence is provided on behalf of Scottish Power Limited (a major UK energy supply, networks and generation business), and ScottishPower Renewable Energy Limited (a leading renewable developer in the UK). Both companies are subsidiaries of Iberdrola S.A. and references to “ScottishPower” and “we” are to either or both companies as the context requires.

2. Scottish Power Limited is an energy business that provides electricity transmission and distribution services to more than 3 million customers, supplies some 5 million electricity and gas services to homes and businesses across Great Britain (GB), and operates electricity generation, gas storage facilities and associated energy management activities in the UK. ScottishPower Renewable Energy Limited (known as ScottishPower Renewables) is part of Iberdrola’s Renewables business, which is the largest developer of renewables globally.

3. This memorandum provides a summary of our views in relation to how the current devolution arrangements for energy policy and planning affect the delivery of the Welsh Government’s desired future energy mix in Wales. Given our significant involvement in Wales as a Distribution Network Operator (DNO), an energy supplier and a developer of renewable energy, ScottishPower is keen work with the Welsh and UK Governments to understand how climate change and security of supply objectives can be met.

Current Development in Wales

SP Energy Networks

4. SP Energy Networks (SP Manweb) is the licensed Distribution Network Operator (DNO) in Merseyside and in north and mid Wales. SP Manweb operates in a highly regulated environment with targets set by the UK energy regulator, Ofgem. Our network consists of over 65,000km of underground cables and 47,000km of overhead lines, which distributes electricity to over 400,000 points of supply in north and mid Wales. Planned developments in Wales include:

- Onshore wind farm 132kV connections including substation development for Tirgwynt Wind Farm and Llandinam Wind Farm currently in planning system;
- 10 Contracted network connections including substation development in mid Wales to connect onshore wind farms in Strategic Search Areas B, C and D amounting to approximately 800MW;

- 3 Contracted network connections in north Wales to connect wind farms in SSA A amounting to approximately 180MW;
- Associated development linked to the proposed west coast HV DC link between south west Scotland and north Wales providing 2GW capacity;
- Substation developments including Aberystwyth, Flint, Holywell; and,
- Upgrading overhead lines throughout the north and mid Wales area including undergrounding existing lines in Snowdonia National Park

ScottishPower Renewables

5. ScottishPower Renewables in a joint venture with Eurus Energy (UK) has been operating the existing Penrhyddlan and Llidiartywaun windfarm in Powys since 1992. ScottishPower Renewables is also actively developing more onshore wind generation in Wales to assist the Welsh Government in meeting its sustainability targets. Planned developments in Wales include:

- The repowering of the Llandinam windfarm site, currently the subject of a S36 application, submitted in 2008;
- The Mynydd windfarm site (Mynydd Mynyllod) within the local authority areas of Denbighshire and Gwynedd which is in the process of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and will be submitted to the Infrastructure Planning Commission (or its successor) in early 2012; and,
- The Dyfnant windfarm located in Forestry Commission Wales' Dyfnant Forest in the county of Montgomeryshire, Powys. This project is undergoing Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and will be submitted to the Infrastructure Planning Commission (or its successor) in early 2012.

Recent Experience with the Consenting Process in Wales

6. Despite Wales' renewable energy aspirations, the delivery of wind farm projects and grid projects has proved to be slow and unpredictable. Local planning authorities have been unable to progress wind farm planning applications (both TCPA applications and Section 36/IPC applications) with grid transmission system upgrades in a timely manner. Transport related issues have also proven to be a serious obstacle, even for those projects with grid capacity already secured and no cumulative traffic impacts.

7. Our concern is that without planning applications being considered within a reasonable timescale, investors could ultimately turn to alternative markets where there is greater certainty, either elsewhere in the UK, in Europe or beyond. This could limit the contribution renewable energy can make to the Welsh economy and could jeopardise the delivery of the Welsh Government's renewable electricity targets. Furthermore, recent Welsh Government announcements relating to renewables policy have also created some uncertainty, which has left the industry confused as to intentions of the Government. We ask that clarification be provided in this area.

Implications if Energy Consents Remain Reserved to the UK Government

8. The Climate Change Act 2008 commits the UK to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 80% by 2050, and the EU Renewable Energy Directive requires 15% of all energy to be from renewable sources by 2020. These policy instruments provide the framework for the UK to increase its electricity generated by renewables from 6.7% in 2009 to in excess of 30% by 2020. When considered alongside the further need to replace over a quarter of the existing generation, the scale and urgency of the energy challenge across the entire UK is clear.

9. To meet climate change targets and maintain secure energy supplies across the UK, Ofgem estimate that £200 billion worth of investment is needed in all forms of sustainable energy and related infrastructure by 2020. In our view, certainty and stability within the planning system is the critical factor in enabling this level of investment to come forward and in ensuring that these much needed projects are delivered. As such, we are keen to work positively and collaboratively with whichever consenting authority has responsibility for energy projects in Wales. It is more important to ensure that all decisions are firmly based on existing policies and the national energy need. Should energy consenting powers be devolved to the Welsh Government, we believe this should be viewed as an opportunity for the Welsh Government to demonstrate its commitment to delivering renewable energy in Wales by using these powers to increase the rate of deployment.

10. Other devolved administrations have been able to demonstrate a sense of urgency in decision making but only where the targets are clear, the policies supportive and the capacity / capability to make consenting decisions exists. Should energy consenting powers be devolved to the Welsh Government, it is vital that the process is properly resourced and linked to professional energy expertise available within Planning Inspectorate Wales. Consenting officials would need to be capable of making informed recommendation to Welsh Ministers and for this reason we would advocate learning from the experience of, for example, the Scottish Government, who have demonstrated strong capability and leadership in this area.

How this Affects the Achievement of the Welsh Government's Aspirations

11. Under the present arrangements, we believe that the best way of meeting the Welsh Government's aspirations as set out in the Energy Policy Statement is by greater cross-government co-operation between the administrations in London and Cardiff. Given the numerous changes that have taken place in planning policy, it is critical at this stage for investors to deal with stable and predictable planning or consenting procedures. Any cross border issues should be dealt with quickly and effectively.

12. Should consenting powers remain reserved to the UK Government, consideration could be given to the option of Welsh Ministers being consulted by the DECC Secretary of State when making decisions associated within Welsh projects. However, given the urgency of the energy challenges, it would be imperative that decisions were still made within the 3 month timescale already established.

Welsh Government Aspirations for a Diverse Mix of Renewable Sources

13. We believe that delivering a diverse mix of renewable technologies is important. However, the importance of onshore wind within the renewable energy mix to 2020 and beyond should not be underestimated. Onshore wind underpins investor confidence across the entire renewables sector. As such, continued focus on supporting onshore wind as a proven, financially viable technology is needed to ensure that current renewable energy and climate change obligations are met. This is essential to the delivery of the desired future mix of renewable technologies and must be the immediate priority.

14. Whilst we support ambitious targets for marine energy, in our view, the achievement of 4GW of marine energy in Wales by 2025 is unrealistic. Our own estimates suggest that even with an increase in the current level of industry capacity, it is likely that we will have a UK total of 1.6GW by the end of this decade. Renewable UK's 'Wave and Tidal Energy State of the Industry Report 2011' outlines industry-agreed scenarios for deployment, with the highest estimate being up to 2.2GW installed throughout the UK by 2020. On this basis, we believe that the contribution that marine renewables can make to meeting Welsh Government renewable targets may be set too high.

15. Similarly, we support ambitious targets for offshore wind and the policy and funding structures that will be required to achieve these. However, we would welcome clarification of the basis of the Welsh target of a further 15 kWh/d/p of capacity by 2015/6, as this may be difficult to achieve within the existing context of Round 3 development.

How this Affects Delivery of the Welsh Government's GHG Target

16. Under the present arrangements, we believe that the best way for the Welsh Government to deliver its target of a 3% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions per annum from 2011 is for the Welsh and UK Governments to work more collaboratively on decisions for major energy infrastructure projects in Wales. Consideration could be given to the option of Welsh Ministers being consulted by DECC Secretary of State when making decisions associated within Welsh projects, as long as this did not impact the timetable for decision making.

Impact if Consent Decisions are not all taken in accordance with Welsh Planning Policy

17. We believe it to be important that Welsh planning policy is taken into account in making any energy infrastructure related consent decisions relating to Wales. We support current policy as outlined in TAN 8 (July 2005), Planning for Renewable Energy (October 2010) and Planning Policy Wales (February 2011). However, we have some concerns over how some policies are interpreted and applied.

18. We believe that a level of strategic planning is useful in identifying the opportunities and constraints in relation to the potential for renewables in Wales, including the factor that each development needs to be connected to the grid. TAN 8 goes some way towards identifying key areas of activity, with large scale development being focused on the Strategic Search Areas (SSAs). However, this does not and should not preclude suitable developments which could also be brought forward in areas on the edge of and/or outside the SSAs (and which could ease cumulative effects within the SSAs). An allowance for repowering and extension would also be helpful. Wales is the only part of UK to exclude areas that have no apparent constraints. We request that interpretation of TAN 8 is more closely aligned with the more flexible approach taken in the UK's National Policy Statements for Energy.

19. TAN 8 also specifically mentions the ‘very restricted capacity’ in north and mid Wales and specifically that ‘the reinforcement of the network through the construction of new high voltage distribution and transmission lines is vital to the realisation of any significant additional generating capacity as well as providing a more reliable network for electricity users in the western mid Wales area. This represents one of only a few references in national policy to electricity networks in Wales. In bringing forward network schemes in Wales, we believe it is vital for the planning system that such policy is retained and applied in its current form by decision makers in order to achieve Welsh Government renewable policy.

Planning Guidance Petition P-03-273: Transportation of Wind Turbines in Mid Wales

20. The petition states: *We call upon the National Assembly for Wales to urge the Welsh Government to issue guidance to Local Planning Authorities to ensure that communities are properly consulted on wind farm developments, that impact on road infrastructure is properly assessed and that the broader effects of traffic disruption on sectors such as tourism are properly considered before any development is approved to take place. We believe the only way this can be properly concluded is by way of a public inquiry.*

21. Windfarm developments are subject to Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) which ensures that the likely significant effects of any proposal are assessed and minimised and taken into account in the decision making process. The EIA process adopts good practice guidance and methodologies in assessing transportation, among other effects, and includes both a formal and informal consultation of local communities. This occurs from the early stages of the EIA through planning application and beyond. Beyond this, ScottishPower Renewables is working with RUK Cymru and Welsh transport authorities to identify strategic routes and, in turn, to manage the effects of cumulative turbine movements in mid Wales which are anticipated when projects (including those dependent on future grid upgrades) come forward.

22. However, perceived transport issues are holding up the determination of projects that already have grid capacity secured and could be delivered now. In our view, these projects could make an early contribution to Wales’ renewables targets. The concerns of the roads authorities, police and local communities are ones which are routinely dealt with elsewhere via planning conditions post consent. An example of this is where ScottishPower Renewables recently delivered 60 wind turbines to Arecleoch and 28 to Mark Hill (both of which are in remote parts of south-west Scotland) with no associated transport impacts.

23. We support the request that “communities are properly consulted on wind farm developments (and) that impact on road infrastructure is properly assessed”. However, we see no need for a PLI and would ask the Welsh Assembly Government to use this as an opportunity to show leadership and issue a direction to the Local Planning Authorities to address these issues



**ScottishPower
2011**

September

Eitem 3

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd

E&S(4)-08-11 papur 4

Ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru - Tystiolaeth gan y Grid Cenedlaethol



Pwyntiau Allweddol

- Mae ynni yn hanfodol ar gyfer iechyd a ffyniant Prydain. Ac mae angen i'r ynni hwnnw fod yn fforddiadwy, o safbwynt economaidd ac amgylcheddol. Ond mae ynni yn newid – o ble y daw, sut y caiff ei gynhyrchu a'r ffordd y caiff ei ddefnyddio.
- O ystyried y newidiadau yn y diwydiant ynni, yr ymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd ac oedran asedau trawsyrru National Grid, mae angen cryn dipyn o fuddsoddi a datblygu er mwyn sicrhau seilwaith ynni newydd.
- Er mwyn cyrraedd targedau'r Deyrnas Unedig¹, amcangyfrifir bod angen buddsoddi tua £200 biliwn erbyn 2020 mewn pob math o dechnolegau cynhyrchu, trawsyrru a dosbarthu ynni cynaliadwy – mawr a bach, ar y tir ac ar y môr, a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae National Grid ei hunan yn bwriadu buddsoddi £30.7bn yn y systemau trawsyrru nwy a thrydan yn y cyfnod 2013/4-2020/1².
- Gan fod yr 'her ynni' mor eithriadol o fawr, mae'n bwysig cael system gynllunio sy'n hwyluso datblygiad seilwaith ynni mewn ffordd amserol, cost-efeithiol a chyfrifol. Bu National Grid yn gryf o blaid y newidiadau i'r system gynllunio a gyflwynwyd gan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008 yn cynnwys y datganiad clir o bolisi ynni yn y Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol a'r broses gynllunio symlach a gyflwynwyd gan y Ddeddf.

¹ Mae targedau Deddf Newid Hinsawdd 2008 yn rhwymo'r DU i sicrhau gostyngiad o 80% mewn allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr erbyn 2050, ac mae Cyfarwydddeb Ynni Adnewyddadwy yr UE yn mynnu bod 15% o'r holl ynni yn dod o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2020.

² O'n cynllun busnes RIIO T1 a gyflwynwyd i Ofgem yng Ngorffennaf 2011. Cyfanswm y gwariant (nominal) Trawsyrru Trydan National Grid £21.9bn, Trawsyrru Nwy National Grid £8.8bn
<http://www.talkingnetworkstx.com/>

Crynodeb Gweithredol

1. Fel y nodwyd yn Natganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol EN-1³, mae angen mwy o fuddsoddiad mewn technolegau carbon isel ac mewn ffynonellau ynni mwy amrywiol er mwyn diwallu anghenion Prydain am ynni yn y dyfodol. Bydd rhai o'r ffynonellau ynni newydd yn bell o'r rhwydwaith trawsyrru trydan presennol neu bydd angen cryfhau'r rhwydwaith i gario rhagor o bŵer. Bydd angen sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy llai rhagweladwy ar y naill law a gorsafoedd pŵer nwy mwy hyblyg ac atomfeydd mwy sefydlog ar y llall. Caiff mwy o'n nwy naturiol ei fewnforio. Bydd rhai o'r datblygiadau ynni hyn ar y tir a rhai ar y môr. Er mwyn ymateb i'r heriau hyn, bydd angen gwneud newidiadau i'r rhwydweithiau trawsyrru trydan a nwy a datblygu rhwydweithiau i gludo carbon sydd wedi'i ddal a'i storio.
2. Felly, mae angen cyd-destun cryf, clir, cydgysylltiedig a chyfunol o ran polisi ynni a chynllunio er mwyn annog y math cywir o arloesi a buddsoddi – o'r lefel Ewropeaidd a Phrydeinig i'r lefel leol.
3. Mae'r set o Ddatganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol⁴ (NPSs) ym maes ynni, a ddynodwyd yn ddiweddar o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008⁵, wedi cyflwyno fframwaith clir ar gyfer datganiadau polisi cenedlaethol ym Mhrydain ac mae National Grid yn gryf o'u plaid. Dylai'r Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol sicrhau y ceir y cydbwysedd iawn yn yr ystyriaethau ynghylch penderfyniadau am Brosiectau Seilwaith Cenedlaethol eu Harwyddocâd (NSIPs), gan dalu sylw i'r angen am y seilwaith, yr effeithiau lleol a rhan y gymuned yn llunio cynlluniau ar gyfer datblygiadau.
4. Mae National Grid yn gryf o blaid yr eglurdeb y mae'r Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol yn ei roi a'r ffaith ei bod yn ofynnol i benderfyniadau ar geisiadau am gydsyniad o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008 gael eu gwneud yn unol â'r Datganiadau hynny. Yn ein barn ni, mae hyn yn hanfodol ar gyfer y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol. Ceir eglurdeb ynghylch statws y Datganiadau, o ran y broses o benderfynu ar yr NSIPs, y berthynas rhwng y Datganiadau a dogfennau eraill ar bolisi cynllunio ac o ran cynlluniau i ddatblygu a gaiff eu hystyried o dan drefniadau Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990.
5. Materion i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a Llywodraeth Cymru benderfynu arnynt yw'r pwyntiau y mae'r ddwy lywodraeth yn anghytuno arnynt ynghylch cais Cymru i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldebau dros ganiatâd ym maes ynni a pholisi niwclear. Mae National Grid yn croesawu'r ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos bod cytundeb bras ar faterion yn ymnweud ag ynni⁶, ar wahân i'r ddau bwynt hynny.

3

http://www.decc.gov.uk/en/content/cms/meeting_energy/consents_planning/nps_en_infra/nps_en_infra.aspx

⁴ <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2008/29/contents>

⁵ <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2008/29/contents>

⁶ <http://www.assemblywales.org/bus-home/bus-committees/bus-committees-scrutiny-committees/bus-committees-third-sc-home/bus-committees-third-sc-agendas.htm?act=dis&id=159461&ds=2/2010>

6. Yn ogystal â chyd-destun clir ar gyfer polisi cenedlaethol ar ynni a chynllunio, mae Deddf Cynllunio 2008 yn cyflwyno trefn un caniatâd ac yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd am amserlenni ceisiadau am Brosiectau Seilwaith Cenedlaethol eu Harwyddocâd (NSIPs) – system gynllunio symlach, gan sicrhau y dilynir yr arferion gorau yn gyson a bod y gymuned a'r rhanddeiliaid yn cymryd rhan mewn ffordd effeithiol a phriodol. Mae National Grid yn gryf o blaid y drefn newydd.
7. Er bod y syniad o drefn un caniatâd yn fwy perthnasol i Loegr nag i Gymru, gan mai cyfyngedig iawn yw'r gallu i gynnwys datblygiadau cysylltiedig mewn Gorchymyn Caniatâd Datblygu (DCO) yng Nghymru, gellir cynnwys rhai cydsyniadau/caniatadau mewn cais am Orchymyn Caniatâd Datblygu yng Nghymru gyda chytundeb y corff penderfynu arferol. Byddai National Grid yn annog y defnydd pragmataidd o'r dewis hwnnw o dan amgylchiadau priodol.

Cyflwyniad i National Grid

8. Rhoddir yr ymateb hwn ar ran National Grid. Mae National Grid yn berchen ar y gridiau y mae llawer o wahanol ffynonellau ynni wedi'u cysylltu â hwy ac mae'n eu rheoli hefyd. Ym Mhrydain, rydym yn rhedeg systemau sy'n cyflenwi nwy a thrydan ledled yr holl wledydd. Yng Ngogledd Ddwyrain yr Unol Daleithiau, rydym yn darparu pŵer yn uniongyrchol i filiynau o gwsmeriaid. Rydym mewn safle hollbwysig yng nghanol y system ynni. Ni sy'n cysylltu popeth.
9. Ein pwrpas yw cysylltu pobl â'r ynni y maent yn ei ddefnyddio. Mae pawb ohonom yn dibynnu ar gael ynni ar flaenau'n bysedd: adeiladwyd ein cymdeithas ar hynny. O'r gwres a'r golau sydd gennym gartref, a'r pŵer sy'n sicrhau bod ein ffatrioedd a'n swyddfeydd yn dal i weithio, i dechnoleg gyfathrebu symudol a thechnolegau seilwaith eraill sy'n rhan hanfodol o'n ffordd o fyw ni heddiw.
10. Mae hynny'n rhoi National Grid wrth galon un o'r heriau mwyaf sy'n wynebu ein cymdeithas; helpu i greu datblygiadau newydd ym maes ynni adnewyddadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol a datblygu system ynni a all fod yn sail i'n ffyniant economaidd yn yr 21ain ganrif.

Yr angen i allyrru llai o garbon

11. Mae Deddf Newid Hinsawdd 2008⁷ yn nodi ei bod yn rhaid i allyriadau carbon deuocsid (CO²) y Deyrnas Unedig ostwng yn sydyn. Erbyn 2020, mae'n rhaid iddynt fod 34% yn llai nag yn 1990 ac erbyn 2050 mae'n rhaid sicrhau gostyngiad o 80%. Fel y mae Datganiad Polisi Ynni Llywodraeth Cymru – Chwyldro Carbon Isel (Mawrth 2010)⁸ yn cydnabod, mae angen i ni sicrhau bod arnom angen llai o ynni trwy arbed ynni, gwneud mwy o ddefnydd o wres cynaliadwy ac, yn bwysicaf oll, o safbwynt lleihau allyriadau carbon, trwy ddarparu llawer mwy o'r ynni y mae arnom ei angen trwy systemau trydan a thrydan carbon isel. Felly, ar

⁷ <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2008/27/contents>

⁸ <http://wales.gov.uk/docs/desh/policy/100331energystatementen.pdf>

hyn o bryd mae tua 3% o'n hynni yn dod o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy ond, erbyn 2020, mae angen i hyn godi i 15%.

12. Mae National Grid a Llywodraeth Cymru yn cytuno, fel yr amlinellwyd yn Natganiad y Llywodraeth ar Bolisi Ynni, y gallai mynd i'r afael â'r heriau hyn ddod â chyfleoedd economaidd sylweddol. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol cael fframwaith polisi cryf i annog pobl i arloesi ac i fuddsoddi mewn ynni adnewyddadwy ac mewn arbed ynni er mwyn lleihau allyriadau carbon, sicrhau manteision economaidd, diogelu ffynonellau ynni, creu swyddi ac annog meithrin sgiliau.

Diogelu ffynonellau ynni

13. Gall ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy fod yn llai rhagweladwy, ond mae risgiau gyda ffynonellau eraill hefyd, fel y dangoswyd gan ddamwain Deepwater Horizon yng Ngwlff Mexico, y problemau a gafwyd yn atomfa Fukushima yn Japan, ac effaith yr aflonyddwch yng Ngogledd Affrica a'r Dwyrain Canol ar gyflenwadau olew. Er mwyn talu sylw i hyn, bydd angen cyfuniad mwy amrywiol yn y dyfodol o wahanol fathau o ynni – ac o ba ran o'r byd y dôn nhw.

Mae ein cyflenwadau nwy yn dod i ben

14. Gan fod adnoddau nwy Môr y Gogledd yn prinhaus, nid ydym yn hunan-gynhaliol mewn nwy bellach. Yn 2000, ychydig iawn o nwy a fewnforiwyd gan y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn 2011, mae 50% o'n nwy yn cael ei fewnforio ac, erbyn 2020, bydd y ffigwr hwn wedi codi i tua 75%. Mae hanner y nwy yr ydym yn ei fewnforio yn cael ei bibellu o dan y môr o Norwy neu gyfandir Ewrop ac mae'r hanner arall – y rhan fydd yn cynyddu – yn Nwy Naturiol Hylifedig (LNG), sy'n cael ei fewnforio mewn llongau. Wrth gwrs, mae Cymru eisoes yn chwarae rhan allweddol yn y maes hwn gyda safleoedd mewnforio South Hook a Dragon yn Aberdaugleddau a rhwydwaith piblinellau cysylltiedig National Grid a osodwyd yn y 5 mlynedd diwethaf.
15. Gall y cyflenwadau o nwy a fewnforir amrywio. Gall eu ffynhonnell, eu prisiau a'u hargaeledd newid yn aml, gan ddibynnu ar ffactorau yn cynnwys cytundebau masnachol, gwleidyddiaeth ryngwladol a galw'r farchnad (yn fyd-eang, ond yn Ewrop yn arbennig). Mewn ymateb, mae angen i National Grid wneud llawer mwy i fonitro'r galw a rheoli'r cyflenwad.

Y goblygiadau ar gyfer ein rhwydweithiau trawsyrru ynni

16. Er mwyn sicrhau'r gostyngiad enfawr mewn allyriadau carbon a nodwyd uchod, bydd angen cysylltu ffynonellau trydan carbon is – yn cynnwys ffynonellau adnewyddadwy fel ynni gwynt – â'r rhwydwaith trawsyrru trydan. Cynlluniwyd y grid trawsyrru presennol i drafod trydan o ffynonellau mawr, sefydlog a dibynadwy ond bydd y ffynonellau newydd – sy'n aml yn dibynnu ar natur – yn naturiol yn fwy anodd eu rhagweld a'u rheoli. Bydd hyn yn golygu cydbwysu, o funud i funud, y cyflenwadau llai rhagweladwy o ynni adnewyddadwy a ffynonellau mwy hyblyg fel gorsafoedd pŵer nwy a ffynonellau sefydlog fel atomfeydd.

17. Y farn gyffredin yw y bydd newid mawr o ran ffynonellau ein trydan a sut y caiff ei ddefnyddio, ond does neb yn gwybod yn union pa ffurf fydd ar y cyfuniad o gyflenwad a'r galw. Er enghraifft, ar hyn o bryd, ceir contractau i gysylltu dros 60 gigawat o ynni â'n rhwydwaith ni yn y dyfodol ond, mewn gwirionedd, dim ond tua hanner hynny fydd yn cael ei gysylltu. Felly, er y bydd angen cysylltiadau ar ynni o ffynonellau cynhyrchu newydd – rhai mewn ardaloedd anghysbell lle bydd angen prosiectau adeiladu mawr – ni allwn ragweld yn union lle na phryd y bydd hyn yn digwydd.
18. O ran ein rhwydwaith trawsyrru nwy, er na wyddom eto beth fydd union effaith y newidiadau yn ffynonellau ein nwy naturiol, gwyddom y bydd angen i ni addasu ein system i ymdopi â'r newidiadau hyn, er enghraifft gan y bydd llawer mwy o LNG yn cael ei fewnforio.
19. Felly, mae'n hollol amlwg bod rhaid buddsoddi'n sylweddol yn seilwaith ynni y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn cyrraedd ein targedau ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy a lleihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid. Er mwyn gwneud y gwaith buddsoddi a datblygu mewn pryd, mae'n hanfodol bod systemau cynllunio y Deyrnas Unedig yn cael eu symleiddio, eu cysoni a'u cydgysylltu hyd y bo modd er mwyn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd, effeithlonrwydd a chysondeb i bawb a chynnal ansawdd y gwaith penderfynu ar yr un pryd. Er mwyn gwneud hyn, mae'n hanfodol bod y nodau y mae systemau cynllunio cenedlaethol Cymru, Lloegr a'r Alban yn anelu atynt yn cael eu cysoni â'i gilydd a, hyd y bo modd, â pholisiau cynllunio 'lleol'.

Prosiectau cyfredol National Grid yng Nghymru

20. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gan National Grid un prosiect yng Nghymru y mae'r Comisiwn Cynllunio Seilwaith wedi'i hysbysu amdano. Mae prosiect Cysylltiad Canolbarth Cymru i gysylltu ffermydd gwynt TAN8 arfaethedig yn un trawsffiniol â Lloegr ac mae newydd fod trwy'r cyfnod cyntaf o ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd cyn gwneud y cais. Prosiect arall yng Nghymru sydd newydd ddechrau pennu dewisiadau strategol yw prosiect Cysylltiad Gogledd Cymru, sy'n ystyried pa waith y bydd raid ei wneud i gysylltu atomfa newydd yr Wylfa a Chylch 3, ffermydd gwynt ar y môr ym Môr Iwerddon.
21. Yn ogystal, rydym yn datblygu cynlluniau ar y cyd gyda Scottish Power Transmission ar gyfer cysylltiad DC foltedd uchel tanfor rhwng Hunterston yn yr Alban a Glannau Dyfrdwy, sy'n gynllun trawsffiniol rhwng Cymru, Lloegr, Ynys Manaw, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban o ran dyfroedd tiriogaethol. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw'n cynnwys cysylltiad tanfor 2000MW gyda gorsafoedd trawsnewid a cheblau tanddaear ar y tir mewn rhannau o Gymru a Lloegr (yn dod i'r lan ar benrhyn Cilgwri) ac yn yr Alban ac nid oes arno angen caniatâd o dan y Ddeddf Gynllunio. Cafwyd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ym mis Chwefror 2011 a bwriedir cyflwyno cais cynllunio am yr orsaf drawsnewid yng Nghei Connah i Gyngor Sir y Fflint cyn hir.

Y cwestiynau y mae'r Ymchwiliad yn eu hystyried

Beth yw'r goblygiadau i Gymru os bydd y cyfrifoldeb dros ganiatáu prosiectau seilwaith mawr ar y tir mawr ac ar y môr yn parhau i fod yn fater sy'n cael ei gadw yn ôl gan Lywodraeth y DU?

22. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi datgan ei barn yn glir, mewn dadl yn Neuadd Westminster ar 6 Medi 2011, ddiwethaf, mai'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd ddylai wneud penderfyniadau ar brosiectau ynni mawr yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Esboniodd y Gweinidog dros Newid Hinsawdd, Greg Barker, bod angen system unedig ar gyfer polisi ynni a chynllunio dros Gymru a Lloegr a bod gan lywodraeth y DU hawl ddemocrataidd i gymryd penderfyniadau fel hyn ynghylch Cymru, gan ei bod yn atebol i etholwyr Cymru. O ran y drefn lle mae ceisiadau i godi gorsafoddd newydd i gynhyrchu trydan ar y tir yn dod o dan y Ddeddf Cynllunio os byddant yn gallu cynhyrchu mwy na 50MW, esboniodd Mr Barker bod Llywodraeth y DU o'r farn bod y trothwy o 50MW yn addas gan fod arwyddocâd ar lefel y DU i ddatblygiadau mwy na hyn, yn cynnwys ffermydd gwynt mawr, ac felly mai Llywodraeth y DU ddylai wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch eu datblygu.
23. Rydym yn gryf o blaid yr egwyddor a nodwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU ei bod yn rhaid cael cael cyd-destun cryf, clir, cydgysylltiedig a chyfunol o ran polisi ynni a chynllunio a system gynllunio mor effeithiol ag y bo modd er mwyn annog yr arloesi a'r buddsoddi angenrheidiol mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni a thechnolegau carbon isel newydd.
24. Mae Deddf Cynllunio 2008 wedi cyflwyno trefn gynllunio symlach yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar gyfer rhai mathau o NSIPs. Dynodwyd nifer o Ddatganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol hefyd sy'n nodi'n glir bolisi'r Llywodraeth ar yr angen am y gwahanol fathau o NSIPs newydd ac yn egluro pa fathau o ddatblygiad sydd yn unol â pholisi'r Llywodraeth a pharai nad ydynt.
25. Yn dilyn proses o ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd, ac adolygu a chadarnhau gan y Senedd, cafodd set o chwe Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol yn ymwneud ag ynni eu dynodi ym mis Gorffennaf 2011:
- Y Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol Cyffredinol drafft ar gyfer Ynni (EN-1)
 - Y Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol drafft ar gyfer Seilwaith Cynhyrchu Trydan Tanwydd Ffosil (EN-2)
 - Y Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol drafft ar gyfer Seilwaith Ynni Adnewyddadwy (EN-3)
 - Y Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Seilwaith Cyflenwi Nwy a Phibellau Nwy ac Olew (EN-4)
 - Y Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol drafft ar gyfer Seilwaith Rhwydweithiau Trydan (EN-5)
 - Y Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol drafft ar gyfer Cynhyrchu Ynni Niwclear (EN-6)
26. Ar ôl dynodi'r rhain, mae'n rhaid i benderfyniadau ynghylch ceisiadau am Orchmyinion Caniatâd Datblygu (DCO) sy'n ymwneud ag ynni gael eu gwneud yn unol â'r Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol perthnasol, ac eithrio i'r

graddau y byddai gwneud hynny yn torri ymrwymadau rhyngwladol, neu ddyletswyddau neu gyfreithiau eraill, neu lle byddai'r datblygiad yn gwneud mwy o ddrwg nag o les.

27. Felly, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi nodi'n glir bod Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol yn ganolog i'r drefn newydd ac mai dyma yw'r brif sail dros wneud penderfyniadau ar NSIPs. Felly, y rhain yw'r brif ddogfen bolisi ar gyfer yr IPC, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ymgeiswyr ac eraill sy'n ymwneud â'r mater pan fyddant yn ystyried ceisiadau am ganiatâd o dan y Ddeddf Cynllunio⁹.

28. Mae National Grid yn croesawu ac yn cefnogi'n gryf ddynodiad y Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol sy'n ymwneud ag ynni, yr eglurdeb y maent yn ei roi a'r ffaith ei bod yn ofynnol i benderfyniadau am geisiadau am ganiatâd o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008 gael eu gwneud yn unol â'r Datganiadau hynny. Yn ein barn ni, mae hyn yn hanfodol ar gyfer y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol. Mae eglurdeb ynghylch y berthynas rhwng y Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol ac ystyriaethau perthnasol eraill, yn cynnwys polisiau cynllunio yng Nghymru, yn hanfodol hefyd. Mewn ymateb i'r ymghyngoriadau ar y Datganiadau drafft, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cydnabod mai'r Datganiadau yw'r brif sail dros benderfyniadau am NSIPs ac mae wedi galw am sicrhau mai Polisi Cymru yw'r brif sail dros benderfyniadau nad ydynt yn cael eu gwneud gan yr IPC.¹⁰

29. Mae'r chwe Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol ym maes ynni a ddynodwyd ym mis Gorffennaf 2011:

- (i) yn cadarnhau mai nhw yw'r brif sail dros benderfyniadau ynghylch Gorchmynion Caniatâd Datblygu am brosiectau NSIP;
- (ii) yn nodi'n glir bod materion eraill y gall yr IPC eu hystyried, yn cynnwys adroddiadau am effeithiau lleol a gyflwynir gan yr awdurdod lleol perthnasol, dogfennau'n ymwneud â'r Cynllun Datblygu neu ddogfennau eraill yn y Fframwaith Datblygu Lleol a Datganiadau Polisi Morol;
- (iii) yn esbonio mai'r Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol sydd drechaf at ddibenion penderfyniadau'r IPC os ceir gwrthdaro rhwng y Dogfennau Polisi Cenedlaethol neu unrhyw ddogfen arall a'r Datganiad Polisi Cenedlaethol gan fod y seilwaith o arwyddocâd trwy Gymru a Lloegr;
- (iv) yn cadarnhau bod y Datganiadau yn debygol o fod yn ystyriaeth berthnasol wrth benderfynu ar geisiadau sy'n dod o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 yng Nghymru a Lloegr - penderfynir fesul achos faint o bwysau a roddir arnynt; ac
- (v) yn cadarnhau bod y Datganiadau wedi talu sylw i Nodiadau Cymorth Technegol (TAN) yng Nghymru lle bo'n briodol.

30. Yn ogystal, mae'r IPC wedi cadarnhau nad yw polisiau Llywodraeth Cymru yn cario'r un pwysau â'r Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol mewn

⁹ <http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/planningandbuilding/pdf/1376507.pdf>

¹⁰ http://www.decc.gov.uk/en/content/cms/meeting_energy/consents_planning/nps_en_infra/resp_2nd_cons/resp_2nd_cons.aspx

penderfyniadau am geisiadau am ganiatâd o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008¹¹ er y byddant yn ystyriaeth bwysig lle bônt yn berthnasol. Felly, mae National Grid yn teimlo bod statws y Datganiadau a'r berthynas rhyngddynt a dogfennau eraill ym maes polisi cynllunio yn ddigon clir.

31. Yn ogystal â chyd-destun clir ar bolisi ynni a chynllunio cenedlaethol, mae Deddf Cynllunio 2008 yn cyflwyno'r syniad o un caniatâd ac yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd am amserlenni ceisiadau am Brosiectau Seilwaith Cenedlaethol eu Harwyddocâd. Mae National Grid yn gryf o blaid yr egwyddor o system gynllunio symlach lle gall penderfyniadau am brosiect seilwaith mawr a ddatblygwyd trwy broses o ymwneud yn briodol â chymunedau ac ymgylchoreion eraill fynd trwy broses ymgeisio am un caniatâd yn unig.
32. Mae National Grid yn nodi na chaiff ei hystyried yn briodol i ddatganoli'r cyfrifoldeb am roi caniatâd i brosiectau ynni am y rhesymau a amlinellwyd uchod ac felly nad yw ar agenda Llywodraeth San Steffan hyd yma. A ninnau'n gwmni sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru a Lloegr, byddem yn bryderus pe bai gennym brosiect trawsffiniol a hwnnw'n cael caniatâd yn y naill neu'r llall yn unig o'r ardaloedd gweinyddol oherwydd gwahaniaeth barn rhwng Lywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch materion polisi ynni.
33. Ar y cychwyn disgrifiwyd y newidiadau i Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008 fel 'trefn un caniatâd', ond bellach deallir fod y broses mewn difrif yn ymwneud â chydlynu caniatâd o dan wahanol gyfundrefnau. Mae'r 'amserlennu cydweithredol' hwn yn arwain at yr hyn a ddisgrifir fel 'trefn ganiatáu aliniedig'. Er bod y syniad o'r drefn un caniatâd yn fwy perthnasol i Loegr nag i Gymru, gan fod gwaith datblygu cysylltiedig yng Nghymru wedi'i gyfyngu i rai mathau o waith sy'n ymwneud â chynlluniau i storio nwy o dan y ddaear mewn haenau mandyllog naturiol, mae rhai cydsyniadau/caniatadau y gall cais am Orchymyn Caniatâd Datblygu ddarparu ar eu cyfer yng Nghymru gyda chytundeb y corff penderfynu arferol. Mae Adran 150 o'r Ddeddf Cynllunio, a Rheoliadau 2(1) a 2(2) o'r Rheoliadau Cynllunio Seilwaith (Darpariaethau Rhagnodedig Amrywiol) 2010 yn berthnasol yn hyn o beth. Byddai National Grid yn annog Llywodraeth Cymru a sefydliadau eraill i ddefnyddio'r disgresiwn hwnnw mewn ffordd bragmataidd o dan amgylchiadau priodol lle mai nhw yw'r corff penderfynu arferol.
34. Yn ein Nodyn Cyngor 11: "Working with Public Bodies – Part 1" (Mai 2011)¹², mae'r IPC yn annog datblygwyr ac ymgylchoreion i benderfynu mor fuan ag y bo modd yn y cyfnod cyn gwneud y cais ar raglen gynhwysfawr a manwl o'r amrediad o ganiatadau tebygol a all fod yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer NSIP. Mae'n eu hannog hefyd i drafod gyda'r cyrff cydsynio arferol a fyddai'n briodol cynnwys y caniatadau hynny mewn cais am Orchymyn Caniatâd Datblygu neu i'r Gorchymyn wneud cyfrif amdanynt. Lle bo cydsyniadau, trwyddedau a chaniatadau eraill i gael eu cynnwys mewn cais am Orchymyn Caniatâd Datblygu, mae'r IPC yn cynghori ymgylchoreion a datblygwyr i amseru eu trafodaethau er mwyn

¹¹ http://www.assemblywales.org/sc_3_-19-10_paper_1_-_evidence_from_the_infrastructure_planning_commission.pdf

¹² <http://infrastructure.independent.gov.uk/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/Advice-note-11-Working-with-public-bodies.pdf>

cael cymaint o gytundeb ag y bo modd cyn gwneud y cais. Yn ogystal, mae'r Comisiwn yn annog datblygwyr i roi gwybodaeth i gefnogi eu cais am DCO gan nodi pa mor agos ydynt at ganiatadau felly o dan ddeddfwriaeth arall lle gwnaed cais am y rheiny eisoes cyn y cais DCO. Disgwylir i'r Comisiwn gyhoeddi rhagor o arweiniad yn y maes hwn. Mae'r Comisiwn wedi dweud bod "ystyried y trefniadau yng Nghymru" yn rhan o'r symud oddi wrth 'trefn un caniatâd' tuag at 'drefn ganiatáu aliniedig'. Gallai olygu nad yw'n bwysig ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei gynnwys o fewn unrhyw DCO; gallai fod lawn bwysiced cydlynu materion sydd yn disgyn y tu allan i DCO.

35. Felly, bydd National Grid mewn cysylltiad agos iawn â nifer o gyrff penderfynu yn y cyfnod cyn gwneud y cais ynglŷn â nifer fawr, o bosib, o gydsyniadau atodol a all fod yn angenrheidiol mewn cysylltiad â chynlluniau ar gyfer NSIPs, yng Nghymru a Lloegr, er mwyn ystyried yr union gwestiynau hyn. Er bod rhai gwahaniaethau yng Nghymru o ran datblygiadau cysylltiedig ac felly y gall y drefn ar gyfer rhoi caniatâd yng Nghymru fod yn fwy darniog, mae National Grid o'r farn na ddylai fod gwahaniaeth mawr yn y ffordd o fynd ati ynglŷn â materion atodol.
36. Yn ei sefyllfa bresennol ac mewn perthynas â Deddf Cynllunio 2008, mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru swyddogaethau a chyfrifoldebau neilltuol ym maes cynllunio seilwaith, o ran:
- meysydd sydd wedi'u datganoli ar gyfer ffurfio polisiâu yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys cynllunio gofodol morol yn nyfroedd tiriogaethol Cymru allan hyd at 200 o filltiroedd morol;
 - swyddogaethau rheoleiddio uniongyrchol;
 - corff rhagnodedig (ymgynggorai statudol) at ddibenion gofynion ymgynggori Deddf Cynllunio 2008 cyn gwneud y gais, ar gyfer yr holl gynigion sy'n debygol o effeithio ar dir yng Nghymru;
 - corff ymgynggori at ddibenion gofynion cwmpasu Asesiadau o'r Effaith Amgylcheddol (EIA) o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008 ar gyfer yr holl gynigion sy'n debygol o effeithio ar dir yng Nghymru. Mae'r IPC wedi cadarnhau y bydd y rhain yn cynnwys y rhai sy'n ymwneud at NSIPs ar ororau Cymru, mewn dyfroedd tiriogaethol ac ar bob cynllun am safle niwclear;
 - y sawl y mae a wnelo ag unrhyw gais am DCO sydd wedi'i dderbyn o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio 2008;
 - trwyddedau morol yn nyfroedd tiriogaethol Cymru, allan hyd at 200 o filltiroedd morol, ar gyfer gweithgareddau yn y môr neu drosto, neu ar wely'r môr neu oddi tano, a allai gynnwys gosod llinellau uwchben, ceblau a phiblinellau neu waith ymchwiliol fel arolygon ymwthiol;
 - penderfynydd ar gyfer rhai apelau a chydysyniadau eraill;
 - swyddogaeth yn ardystio na fydd tir a roddir yn gyfnewid am dir categori arbennig (e.e. Tir Comin) yn llai manteisiol;
 - goruchwyllo asiantaethau fel Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru; a
 - cefnogi a hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg.
37. Mae National Grid yn croesawu'r canllawiau yn Nodyn Cyngor 12 yr IPC sy'n annog datblygwyr, cyrff penderfynu ac ymgyngoreion i gydweithio'n agos â'i gilydd ar faterion atodol ac rydym yn llawn fwriadu ymroi i

gydweithio ac ymgysylltu ag eraill gyda'n cynigion ni am NSIPs. Rydym hefyd yn croesawu'r Memorandwm Dealltwriaeth rhwng yr IPC a Llywodraeth Cymru¹³ sy'n nodi swyddogaethau gweithredol a phrotocolau cydgysylltu er mwyn pennu'r fframwaith ar gyfer cydweithio rhwng yr IPC a Llywodraeth Cymru ar faterion yn ymwneud a NSIPs yng Nghymru, gan gydnabod ei bod yn rhaid i'r ddau sefydliad wneud eu penderfyniadau mewn ffordd ddi-duedd ac annibynnol. Gyda chysylltiadau cadarnhaol a chyfathrebu brwd rhwng y ddau faes hyn, dylai fod yn haws sicrhau'r system gynllunio symlach yr oedd Deddf Cynllunio 2008 yn ceisio'i sefydlu.

Beth fydd yr effaith os na fydd penderfyniadau caniatáu ar gyfer prosiectau seilwaith mawr a datblygiadau cysylltiedig yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â pholisi cynllunio Cymru?

38. Yn ôl Gweinidog blaenorol yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai, Jane Davidson, ar wahân i fater cyfrifoldebau caniatáu datblygiadau ynni a pholisi niwclear, mae polisi ynni y DU a Chymru yn cytuno ar nifer o bwyntiau sylfaenol ynghylch yr angen i sicrhau ynni fforddiadwy, diogel, carbon isel ar gyfer ein pobl¹⁴. Mae'r Datganiadau Polisi Cenedlaethol a gyflwynwyd yn dilyn proses ymgynghori dryloyw a phroses seneddol atebol a oedd yn agored i bawb yng Nghymru a Lloegr, wedi pennu'r fframwaith cenedlaethol ar gyfer polisi ynni a bydd yn cael blaenoriaeth mewn penderfyniadau ar gynlluniau ar gyfer NSIPs yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol cael cyd-destun cryf, clir, cydgysylltiedig a chyfunol o ran polisi ynni a chynllunio a system gynllunio mor effeithiol ag y bo modd er mwyn annog y math cywir o arloesi a buddsoddi mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni a thechnolegau carbon isel newydd.

Sut mae hyn effeithio ar gyflawni dyheadau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer gwahanol fathau o ynni adnewyddadwy a charbon isel, fel y'u nodir yn y Datganiad Polisi Ynni?

39. Fel yr esboniwyd cynt yn y dystiolaeth hon, y farn gyffredinol yw y bydd newid mawr o ran ffynonellau ein trydan a sut y caiff ei ddefnyddio, ond does neb yn gwybod yn union pa ffurf fydd ar y cyfuniad o'r cyflenwad a'r galw. Er enghraifft, ar hyn o bryd, ceir contractau i gysylltu dros 60 gigawat o ynni â'n rhwydwaith ni yn y dyfodol ond, mewn gwirionedd, dim ond tua hanner hynny fydd yn cael ei gysylltu. Felly, er y bydd angen cysylltiadau ar ynni o ffynonellau cynhyrchu newydd – rhai mewn ardaloedd anghysbell lle bydd angen prosiectau adeiladu mawr – ni allwn ragweld yn union lle na phryd y bydd hyn yn digwydd. Ar wahân i'r cwestiwn pwysig ynghylch datblygu atomfeydd newydd yng Nghymru, ymddengys bod cytundeb bras rhwng polisi ynni y DU a Chymru ar yr

¹³ <http://infrastructure.independent.gov.uk/2010/10/infrastructure-planning-commission-and-welsh-assembly-government-agree-memorandum-of-understanding/>

¹⁴ <http://www.assemblywales.org/bus-home/bus-committees/bus-committees-scrutiny-committees/bus-committees-third-sc-home/bus-committees-third-sc-agendas.htm?act=dis&id=159461&ds=2/2010>

angen i sicrhau ynni fforddiadwy, diogel, carbon isel, ac rydym yn nodi ac yn croesawu hynny¹⁵.

Sut mae hyn yn effeithio ar gyflawni targed Llywodraeth Cymru o gael gostyngiad o 3 y cant mewn allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr bob blwyddyn o 2011 ymlaen?

40. Gweler yr ateb i'r cwestiwn blaenorol uchod.

23 Medi 2011

¹⁵ <http://www.assemblywales.org/cy/bus-home/bus-third-assembly/bus-committees/bus-committees-scrutiny-committees/bus-committees-third-sc-home/bus-committees-third-sc-agendas.htm?act=dis&id=159461&ds=2/2010>

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd

Lleoliad: **Ystafell Bwyllgora 1 - Y Senedd**

Dyddiad: **Dydd Mercher, 19 Hydref 2011**

Amser: **09:30 - 11:45**

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Gellir gwyllo'r cyfarfod ar Senedd TV yn:

http://www.senedd.tv/archiveplayer.jsf?v=cy_200000_19_10_2011&t=0&l=cy

Cofnodion Cryno:

Aelodau'r Cynulliad:

Dafydd Elis-Thomas (Cadeirydd)
Mick Antoniw
Rebecca Evans
Russell George
Vaughan Gething
Llyr Huws Gruffydd
Julie James
Antoinette Sandbach
Mark Drakeford
Eluned Parrott

Tystion:

Llewelyn Rhys, Pennaeth, RenewableUK Cymru
Piers Guy, Pennaeth Datblygu, Nuon Renewables
Caroline McGurgan, Rheolwr Prosiect, Eco2
John Griffiths, Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Christianne Glossop, Prif Swyddog Milfeddygol
Matthew Quinn, Llywodraeth Cymru

Staff y Pwyllgor:

Virginia Hawkins (Clerc)
Catherine Hunt (Dirprwy Clerc)
Graham Winter (Ymchwilydd)

1. Cyflwyniadau, ymddiheuriadau a dirprwyon

1.1 Cafwyd ymddiheuriadau gan David Rees a William Powell. Roedd Mark Drakeford ac Eluned Powell yn dirprwyo.

2. Ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru - Tystiolaeth gan RenewableUK Cymru

2.1 Ymatebodd y tystion i gwestiynau gan Aelodau'r Pwyllgor ynghylch polisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru.

2.2 Cytunodd Llewelyn Rhys i ymgynghori ag Aelodau'r Pwyllgor i ddrafftio protocol ar gyfer Cymru ynghylch ymgynghori â chymunedau fel rhan o'r cynlluniau datblygu ar gyfer prosiectau ynni, gan gynnwys y manteision cymunedol.

2.3 Cytunodd Piers Guy i ddarparu manylion gwybodaeth ynghylch manteision cymunedol ar gyfer y prosiectau y mae Nuon Renewables wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â hwy.

2.4 Cytunodd y Pwyllgor i wahodd y tystion i ddod i sesiwn dystiolaeth arall.

3. Cyllideb ddrafft 2012-13: Craffu ar waith Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy

3.1 Ymatebodd Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy a'i swyddogion i gwestiynau gan Aelodau'r Pwyllgor.

3.2 Cytunodd y Gweinidog i ddarparu gwybodaeth ychwanegol ynghylch treulio anaerobig a manylion y costau sy'n gysylltiedig â chreu un corff amgylcheddol.

TRAWSGRIFIAD

Gweld [trawsgrifad o'r cyfarfod](#).

John Griffiths AC /AM
Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Eich cyf/Your ref
Ein cyf/Our ref

Lord Dafydd Elis Thomas AM
Chair of the Environment and
Sustainability Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff

4 October 2011

Dear Dafydd,

Further to my appearance at the Environment and Sustainability Committee, I agreed to follow up in writing a request for information on the number of applications received both above and below 50MW since devolution, and the types of projects.

I have pleasure in providing you with the attached information which outlines the renewable energy projects in Wales which meet these criteria.

In gywir,

John Griffiths AC / AM
Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay
Caerdydd • Cardiff
CF99 1NA

Wedi'i argraffu ar bapur wedi'i ailgylchu (100%)

English Enquiry Line 0845 010 3300
Llinell Ymholiadau Cymraeg 0845 010 4400
Correspondence: John.Griffiths@wales.gsi.gov.uk
Printed on 100% recycled paper

OPERATIONAL ONSHORE WIND FARMS

Under 50MW	Wind Farm	Location	Turbine Model	Power (MW)	Turbines	MW Capacity
Nov-06	Swansea Docks	Swansea	NEG Micon	0.25	1	0.25
Nov-10	BDCR II	Powys	Nordtank 500/37	0.5	1	0.5
Sep-98	Hafoty Ucha 1	Gwynedd	Vestas	0.6	1	0.6
Jan-06	Hafoty Ucha 3 Extension	Gwynedd	V52	0.85	1	0.85
Dec-02	Hafoty Ucha 2 Extension	Gwynedd	Vestas V52	0.85	2	1.7
Jun-09	Castle Pill Farm - repowering	Pembrokeshire	EWT 900 (3) Nordtank (1)	0.9	4	3.2
Feb-01	Parc Cynog	Cardiff	NEG Micon	0.72	5	3.6
Jan-08	Braich Ddu Farm	Gwynedd	Nordex N60	1.3	3	3.9
Jan-03	Mawla (Moel Maelogen)	Conwy	Bonus 1.3	1.3	3	3.9
Jul-02	Blaen Bowi	Cardiff	Nordex	1.3	3	3.9
Dec-09	Solutia UK Ltd	Pembrokeshire	Nordex N90	2.5	2	5
Jun-11	Ferndale	Rhondda Cynon Taff	E48	0.8	8	6.4
Nov-92	Rhyd-y-Groes	Ceredigion	Bonus B300	0.3	24	7.2
Nov-09	Pendine (Parc Cynog Extension I)	Cardiff	Enercon E48	0.8	6	7.8
Feb-04	Llangwryfon repowering	Ceredigion	Vestas V52	0.85	11	9.35
Apr-98	Mynydd Gorddu	Ceredigion	NEG Micon	0.5	19	10.2
Oct-08	Moel Maelogen Extension	Conwy	Siemens	1.3	9	11.7
Apr-06	Mynydd Clogau	Powys	Vestas	0.85	17	14.45

Mar-02	Cemmaes	Powys	Vestas V52	0.85	18	15.3
Mar-09	Carno Extension (Carno 2)	Powys	Siemens 1.3	1.3	12	15.6
Oct-05	Tir Mostyn & Foel Goch	Denbighshire	Gamesa	0.85	25	21.25
Nov-09	Alltwalis	Carmarthenshire	Siemens 2.3	2.3	10	23
May-11	Maesgwyn	Neath Port Talbot	Alstom Eco80	2	13	26
Jun-06	Ffynnon Oer	Neath Port Talbot	Repower Systems MM70	2	16	32

OPERATIONAL ONSHORE WIND FARMS

Over 50MW	Wind Farm	Location	Turbine Model	Power (MW)	Turbines	MW Capacity
Jun-05	Cefn Croes (inc Devils Bridge)	Ceredigion	GE 1.5 se	1.5	39	58.5

WIND FARMS IN PLANNING						
under 50MW	Wind Farm	Location	Turbines	MW Capacity	Developer	
Jun-11	Glyn Farm	Conwy	2	0.45	Bryn-Y-Gwynnt Ltd	
Sep-03	Timet Site	Swansea	3	1.98	EnergyTech	
Oct-10	Ysgellof Farm	Anglesey	2	4	Airvolution Energy	
Jul-11	Oakdale Business Park	Caerphilly	2	5	Bolsterstone Innovative Energy	
Jan-08	Hirfynydd	Neath Port Talbot	9	13.5	Acciona Energy UK Ltd	
Apr-08	Mynydd Clogau Extn	Powys	19	16.15	Novera	
Apr-08	Waun Garno	Powys	11	16.5	Acciona Energy UK Ltd	
Feb-08	Cemmaes 3	Powys	12	18	Acciona Energy UK Ltd	
Jun-10	Hirddywell	Powys	9	27	Nuon Renewables	
Nov-10	Llynfi Afan Renewable Energy Park	Neath Port Talbot	15	30	Gamesa	
Jan-11	Brechfa Forest East	Carmarthenshire	12	36	RWE Npower Renewables	
Jul-10	Carno Wind Farm Extension - Phase III	Powys	18	36	Amegni	
May-09	Hirwan Re-submission	Rhondda Cynon Taff	12	36	Pennant Wind Energy Ventures Ltd	
Apr-09	Bryngydfa	Powys	12	36	BSK Renewables	
Oct-07	Mynydd Waun Fawr	Powys	15	37.5	Nuon Renewables	
Aug-10	Liys Dymper	Denbighshire	14	40	SSE Renewables	
Jun-08	Garreg Lwyd Hill	Powys	23	46	RES	
May-10	Near Esgair Cwn Owen	Powys	19	47.5	Pennant Wind Energy Ventures Ltd	
Dec-10	Bryn Llewlyn	Carmarthenshire	21	48.3	RES UK & Ireland Ltd	

WIND FARMS IN PLANNING						
over 50MW						
Date	Wind Farm	Location	Turbines	MW Capacity	Developer	
Nov-09	ECOCAS (Esgair Cwmowen Central & South)	Powys	17	51	Independent Power Systems	
Dec-07	Llanbadarn Fynydd	Powys	17	51	Nuon Renewables	
May-08	Fferm Wynt Llaithddu	Powys	29	66.7	Fferm Wynt Llaithddu cyf	
Jun-11	Mynydd Y Gwynt/Sweetlamb	Powys	27	81	REH	
Apr-09	Llanbrynmair	Powys	43	98.9	RES	
May-08	Llandinam repowering	Powys	42	126	Scottish Power/Eurus Energy	
Jan-09	Carnedd Wen	Powys	65	195	RWE Npower Renewables	
Nov-09	Pen Y Cywmoedd	Neath Port Talbot	84	252	Nuon Renewables	

CONSENTED WIND FARMS						
under 50MW						
Date	Wind Farm	Location	Turbines	MW Capacity	Developer	
Aug-08	Shipping Hill Plantation	Pembrokeshire	2	1.6	Westerton Energy	
Feb-07	Fochriw Wind Energy Project	Caerphilly	2	2	Eco2	
Apr-09	Mynydd y Gwrhyd Resubmission	Neath Port Talbot	2	4	AAT (Awel Aman Towe)	
Jul-08	Mynydd Portref (extension to Taff Ely - East of Taff Ely)	Rhodda Cynon Taff	11	9.35	Tegni	
May-10	Wear Point	Pembrokeshire	4	10	Infinergy	
Aug-09	Fforch Nest Wind Farm pt1	Bridgend	4	10	RWE Npower Renewables	
Nov-08	Derwydd Bach		10	23	Tegni	
Feb-09	Maerdy	Rhodda Cynon Taff	8	24	Renewable Energy Partnership	
Aug-09	Pant-Y-Wal	Bridgend	10	25	Pennant Wind Energy Ventures Ltd	
Mar-09	Nant Bach Resubmission	Conwy	11	27.5	Nuon Renewables	
Aug-10	Tirgwynt	Powys	12	27.6	RDC	
Jun-09	Mynydd y Betws	Carmarthenshire	15	37.5	Eco2	
Feb-08	Llyn Brenig	Denbighshire	16	40	Brenig Wind Ltd	

OFFSHORE WIND FARMS OPERATIONAL						
Operational	Wind Farm	Location	Turbine Model	Turbines	MW Capacity	Developer
Dec-09	Rhyl Flats	Conwy	Siemens	25	90	RWE Npower Renewables
Jun-05	North Hoyle				60	Beaufort Wind Ltd

Offshore Wind Farms Consented					
Date	Wind Farm	Location	Turbines	MW Capacity	Developer
Dec-08	Gwynf y Mor		160	576	RWE Innogy/SWM/Siemens

Biomass Operational scheme				
Scheme	Output	Developer	Location	Date operational
Western Wood Energy Plant A	14	Western Bioenergy Limited	Port Talbot	2008

Biomass Schemes consented				
Scheme	Output	Developer	Location	Date consented
Prenergy	350	Prenergy	Port Talbot	Consent Granted 2011
Anglesey Aluminium	299	Anglesey Aluminium	Anglesey	Consent granted Sept 2011

Alun Davies AC / AM
Y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a
Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd
Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and
European Programmes



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Eich cyf/Your ref
Ein cyf/Our ref

Lord Dafydd Elis-Thomas AM
Chair of the Environment and Sustainability Committee,
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff CF99 1NA

19 October 2011

Amy Dafydd,

I am writing to you today in your role as chair of the Assembly Environment and Sustainability Committee. Firstly I would like to thank you for inviting me answer questions at the committee held at the Royal Welsh Show on the 19 July at the Young Farmers Centre. I wanted to take this opportunity to update the committee on two key fisheries issues that we discussed at that time.

At the committee I mentioned my intention to legislate to protect inshore fisheries in Wales. As a first stage in that process I wish to remove the iniquitous situation where a small number of fishing vessels are able to prosecute stocks that their contemporaries can not. To do this I propose to remove historic rights sometimes known as grandfather rights or sunset clauses. These rights allow these individuals to use vessels that are larger than the legislation would otherwise allow. I will be launching a consultation shortly on these proposals and hope to have the necessary secondary legislation in place within 6 months. In addition to this I will be launching an informal consultation with the three Welsh inshore fisheries groups looking at provisions for inshore trawling more generally in Wales. I will bring my proposals to the committee as soon as possible.

The Welsh Government is currently exploring the options for a restrictive permit scheme for cockle fishing in the area of Carmarthenshire known as the 'three rivers'. For some time the local community has been working together in relation to this fishery. I want to further build on that and deliver a management regime that will deliver a real benefit to the industry and the local communities. The Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009 makes provision for a permitting scheme under secondary legislation. Schemes of this nature takes significant time, often a number of years, to work through to address the requirements of the various stakeholders. A full public consultation would be needed before any decision could be taken. The area is also within a European Marine Site and so any measures would need to meet the stringent requirements of the Habitats Regulations.

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay
Caerdydd • Cardiff
CF99 1NA

Wedi'i argraffu ar bapur wedi'i ailgylchu (100%)

English Enquiry Line 0845 010 3300
Llinell Ymholiadau Cymraeg 0845 010 4400
Correspondence .Alun.Davies@wales.gsi.gov.uk

Printed on 100% recycled paper

I will keep the committee informed of progress on these matters and will be happy to give further evidence to the committee at the appropriate time.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Alun' with a stylized flourish above it.

Alun Davies AC / AM

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd
Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and European Programmes

Environment and Sustainability Committee
E&S(4)-08-11 paper 7

Correspondence from the Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and European Programmes on actions arising from the Committee's meeting on 13 October on the draft budget 2012-13

1. At the Evidence Session on 13 October the Deputy Minister undertook to provide the following additional information to the Committee:

- Extracts from the Rural Development Plan 2007-2013 Mid Term Evaluation Report covering Sustainability and Equality;
- Information on the applications and approval under the Young Entrants Support Scheme (YESS).

2. The extracts are at Annex A and Annex B respectively. It should also be noted that a full equality assessment was undertaken as part of last year's budget exercise. As there are no significant changes for the 2012-13 budget the results of this exercise are still valid.

3. On YESS, the figures are as follows:

2010/11:

- Number of applications: 121
- **Number of successful applicants: 114**
- Grant amount approved: £1,573,647.96
- Private sector leverage: £2,744,286.93

2011/12:

- Number of applications: 140
- **Number of successful applications: 132**
- Grant amount approved: £1,905,099
- Private sector leverage: £3,978,892

2012/13:

- Projected *minimum* number of successful applications: 100

Rural Development Plan 2007-2013 Mid Term Evaluation: Horizontal and National Questions

To what extent has the programme contributed to promoting sustainable development in rural areas? In particular, to what extent has the programme contributed to the three priority areas for protecting and enhancing natural resources and landscapes in rural areas:

- Biodiversity and the preservation and development of high nature value farming and forestry systems and traditional agricultural landscapes?
- Water?
- Climate Change?

Biodiversity and HNV Farming, Forestry and Landscapes

1. It is difficult to assess the extent to which the RDP has protected biodiversity and high nature value farming and forestry systems because there is little monitoring data for biodiversity and the HNV indicator has not yet been calculated. See section 7.3 for a detailed discussion of the HNV indicator. As discussed in relation to Measure 214, there has been an improvement in the farmland bird species population index. This increased slightly since 2007 but is still lower than when it began in 1994. The main Measures contributing to improvements in biodiversity and HNV are in Axis 2. Since protecting and improving biodiversity has been a primary objective of agri-environment schemes since their inception, it seems very likely that they have had a beneficial impact but firm evidence for this is lacking.
2. The Farming Connect programme is also contributing to reversing biodiversity decline through a number of measures. Firstly, Farming Connect has provided specific environmental and habitat management training courses to farmers. These courses were fully funded and mainly targeted at Tir Gofal agreement holders (of which there are currently 4,000 agreements). The main elements for these training courses were, to enable participants to understand the value of habitats, why management is important and how Tir Gofal fits into the broader UK Biodiversity Action Plan. From the start of the Farming Connect programme in 2008, 60 training events have been delivered pan Wales. As of June 2010, the focus of these training courses have been amended to support the introduction of the new Land Management Scheme, Glastir. Over the summer of 2010, 40 training

events have been delivered which were open to all land managers. Over 3,000 participants attended these events.

Water

- It is clear that the main element of the programme which might have potential for reducing water pollution is the Axis 2. Measure 214 (implemented as Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and OFS) has the area under successful management contributing to water quality as a result indicator. This is an area calculated through scheme design. It does not show additionality and it assumes that scheme design works. The new monitoring system introduced from January 2009 should allow proper monitoring of current schemes by the time of the *Ex-Post* evaluation while the new monitoring system for Glastir will also address this issue in subsequent programming periods. Table 0-1 shows the area of these schemes assessed by scheme managers as contributing to improved water quality through reduced diffuse pollution from agriculture.

Table 0-1: Result Indicators for Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and OFS for water quality.

	Programme Target (2007-2013)	Actual to date (Jan 07-Dec 09) cumulative	Percentage achieved
Areas (Ha) under successful land management contributing to:	487,400	162,611	10.7%
Water quality	94,100	28,919	30.7%

Source: Annual Implementation Report 2009.

Table 0-2: Measure 214 (Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and OFS) and use of inputs and stocking levels

	Crop Protection Chemicals	Manufactured N Fertiliser	Manufactured P Fertiliser	Manufactured K Fertiliser	Livestock Number per Ha
Decreased use (a little or a lot)	25%	31%	24%	23%	37%
Deadweight (would definitely or	38%	41%	40%	41%	58%

possibly have done anyway)					
----------------------------------	--	--	--	--	--

Source: ADAS/Agra CEAS Consulting survey results.

- 4.
5. Table 0-2 shows that use of crop protection inputs and manufactured fertiliser was reduced on between 23% and 31% of farms according to respondents. However, according to the survey respondents a large amount of this reduction would have happened in any case and is therefore deadweight. Given these are predominantly grazing livestock farms (see section 6.6), one would expect this to be associated with a reduction in stocking rate; 37% of farmers in these three schemes said that they had reduced stocking rate, but 58% of these say they would have done this in any case. Total grazing livestock populations in Wales have been falling. These falls in input use and stocking rate can be expected to reduce diffuse water pollution from agriculture. However these schemes were designed before water quality improvement became such a high priority. Any impact on water quality is thus a side-effect of schemes designed for older policy priorities such as conservation of biodiversity.
6. An interview with the Environment Agency Wales (EAW) confirmed that there has been no work carried out which would allow the water quality impact indicator to be constructed.
7. The new Glastir scheme has water quality as a key objective and specific land management prescriptions designed to protect the water quality of streams, rivers and water bodies. There is recognition that nutrient management planning will be more important, in part to reduced diffuse water pollution from agriculture, and plans are afoot to make this available through Farming Connect. A new Catchment Sensitive Farming scheme is piloting specific action to improve water quality in two pilot catchments. In addition agri-environment monitoring contracts awarded in 2009 will improve the assessment of impacts on water quality.
8. Farming Connect has contributed through the subsidised services (WFP and FAS), by providing one-to-one advice and mentoring. The main areas covered are Nutrient Management Planning, NVZ advice and advice on Clean/Dirty Water management. Farming Connect has worked closely with the Environment Agency Wales to promote the benefits (both environmentally and financially) of Nutrient Management Planning and has supported the Catchment Sensitive Farming (CSF) scheme by providing subsidised advice and mentoring to farmers within the NVZ areas.

9. To conclude, the RDP has had some impact on water quality in Wales but mainly, thus far, as a side-effect of Measures implemented with other objectives.

Climate Change

10. Climate change is not an objective of the three agri-environment schemes implemented under Measure 214 (Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and OFS) or the forestry Measures which all have biodiversity, landscape and amenity objectives. Afforestation does play a role in fixing carbon but the areas of new forestry established have been very small. At the mid point there is little impact on climate change but there are plans to address this more directly in the new Glastir scheme. In addition there may be more activity in relation to renewable energy in Business Plan Round 2 of Axes 3 and 4 than in the earlier Round. See section 7.3, Impact Indicator No. 7, Contribution to combating climate change (increase in production of renewable energy).
11. Helping farmers mitigate and adapt to the challenges of Climate Change is one of the cross cutting themes to all FC delivery. Through the Agrisgôp programme, a number of groups have been set up to look at Carbon foot printing their businesses and their products, i.e. beef and lamb. By doing this and benchmarking with other members of the group they are able to look at ways of reducing their carbon foot print.
12. As of August 2009, Farming Connect has set up a Knowledge Transfer Programme for Climate Change in Wales. The aim of the programme is to act as a repository of best practice, disseminate information to the farming and forestry industry, help mitigate the production of greenhouse gases and adapt to the likely future impact of climate change in Wales.
13. The potential of renewable energy efficiency is an area of great interest to farmers participating in Farming Connect. Delivery has been through a number of mechanisms. Firstly through the WFP service, farmers have requested mentoring on topics such as energy audits, renewable energy options on farm (hydro, wind, heat generation and photovoltaic cells), supplying energy to the National Grid and carbon footprinting of produce. Through the Agrisgôp programme, a number of groups have set up to look at energy efficiency topics such as carbon footprinting, renewable energy and supplying energy to the grid. The Farming Connect Climate Change Development Programme has hosted a number of events on topics such as anaerobic digesters, renewables, high sugar grasses and carbon footprinting.
14. As climate change is not a stated objective of any of the schemes contained within the RDP, any impact will be incidental and probably marginal. RDP managers explained that climate change came onto the agenda following the 2008 CAP Health Check and that it will inform the design of future schemes, in order to address the “New Challenges”

agenda (covering water quality and quantity management, carbon management, climate change mitigation, biodiversity and renewable energy).

15. Though outside the period covered by this evaluation, it is worth noting that in October 2010 the Welsh Assembly Government published its Climate Change Strategy for Wales and the accompanying Delivery Plan for Emissions Reduction. The RDP is mentioned as one of the main means of reducing GHG emissions from Welsh Agriculture and Forestry. An annual target from 2010 of 3,000 ha of woodland creation under Glastir has been set. Glastir includes prescriptions to support the preservation of soil carbon and to encourage on-farm renewable energy generation. The contribution to agriculture and land use emissions reduction will depend on the ability of farmers to export renewable energy to the National Grid and the extent to which anaerobic digestion plants can be installed in the dairy sector. Improved mentoring and education of land managers through the Farming Connect scheme will include the promotion of best practice on climate change.

Rural Development Plan 2007-2013 Mid Term Evaluation: Horizontal and National Questions

To what extent has the programme contributed to the promotion of equality between women and men?

1. RDP managers informed the evaluators that the RDP operates on the basis that anyone who is eligible can apply; the targeting is on sectors or groups and is therefore gender neutral. Projects are selected under the PMG on their merits and gender is therefore irrelevant. Schemes under Axes 3 and 4 promote business sustainability and cohesion, again, gender is irrelevant as a decision criteria.
2. The RDP went through equality Impact Assessment and RDP managers explained that considerable attention has been paid to ensuring that there are no barriers to access; this includes the use of specific strategies under Axes 3 and 4 where these are necessary to ensure equality of opportunity. The RDP was not envisaged as a major tool of social change.
3. The Welsh Assembly Government set as a cross-cutting theme of the programme that equal opportunities should be mainstreamed. This covers a broad range of issues, for example young and old people and black and minority ethnic groups but gender is an important component. As part of the evaluation a representative of the equality body, Chwarae Teg, was interviewed. The lack of good information on gender equality in reports to the PMC was noted.
4. The agricultural and forestry industries in Wales have a predominantly male workforce. For example about 80% of full time regular farm workers are male and about 65% of regular part time workers are male (Welsh Assembly Government Statistics for Wales, 2009). No detail is given of the breakdown between men and women in the category "Farmers, partners, directors and spouses" but a large proportion is certain to be male.
5. It is a requirement of the CMEF that for many Measures (for example Measure 111, training and information) a record of the gender balance between participants in schemes be kept. Where this has been done it tends to show that most participants and beneficiaries in Axis 1 and 2 are male which reflects the structure of the industry served.
6. The survey responses to some schemes allow us to look at the balance of jobs created, for example by the PMG scheme. The employment opportunities created by this scheme have been predominately taken up by males, although this is not to say that there is any inherent bias. However, there is no specific mechanism to address gender or other

equal opportunity issues within the framework of the PMG scheme or the SCE scheme.

7. There is no evidence to suggest that support under the RDP has not been provided equally to all who meet eligibility criteria and there is no suggestion that eligibility criteria preclude the involvement of any specific groups. However, it is possible that, inadvertently, certain groups access the support disproportionately. For example, output indicator data made available to the evaluators in relation to Farming Connect shows that 88% of the 667 participants where gender was recorded were male (see Measure 111).
8. Our survey found that 84% of the first partner or director in beneficiary businesses was male. This compares with 83% for non-beneficiaries. While the proportion of first partners or directors who were male increased with farm size and differed by farm type, there were no statistical differences by participation in RDP schemes, which suggests an equality of access.
9. In contrast, two-thirds (67%) of the second partners or directors in beneficiary businesses were female. Similarly, for non-beneficiary businesses 66% of second partners or directors were female. While it does not necessarily follow that the second named female partner or director of a beneficiary business is a spouse, the implication from this is that it is common for partnerships between husbands and wives to name the man first and the women second. If this assumption is correct, then a large proportion (approximately four-fifths) of supported businesses might be family partnerships and this would imply that support under the RDP was more equally distributed by gender. It should be noted that, as farm economic size increases, the proportion of second partners or directors that are female declines, which is consistent with larger farms tending to involve brothers or sons as formal business partners and company directors. A similar pattern of a declining proportion of second partners or directors being female as farm business size increases exists among the non-beneficiary sample. Overall, the conclusion is that while a majority of recorded farm beneficiaries are male they are part of farming family households that include females.
10. In terms of impact, the main area where a differential impact on gender might be apparent is the creation of employment (including protection of existing jobs). Tables presented in relation to each of the RDP Measures reported on employment creation/protection and split this into full-time/part-time and male/female. These can be summarised as follows:
 - Measure 111 (Farming Connect): all of the full-time and part-time full-time equivalent positions (FTEs) that were created were for males.

- Measure 123 (Processing and Marketing Grant scheme): 2.4 jobs were created for males for every job created for females amongst non-farm respondents. Some 73% of the full-time jobs created were for males, as were 64% of part-time jobs. Amongst the farm respondents, 5.1 full-time jobs were created for males for every full-time job created for females although only 0.7 part-time male jobs were created for every female part-time job.
 - Measure 212 (Tir Mynydd): proportionally more female full-time positions have been protected (1.4 full-time female jobs for every 1 full-time male job).
 - Measure 214 (Tir Cynnal, Tir Gofal and Organic Farming Scheme): all full-time and part-time jobs lost as a result of participation are male.
 - Measures 221, 223 and 227 (Better Woodlands for Wales): 2.0 full-time male jobs created for every full-time female job, all part-time jobs created were for males.
11. The picture provided is somewhat mixed. In terms of job creation/protection there is a general dominance of those for males, although the PMG scheme has created proportionally more female part-time jobs. This may reflect the type of work created or, in the case of the PMG scheme, greater flexibility in terms of hours, although this is not testable with the information available to us. Measure 214 has apparently cost male jobs, but not female jobs. Again this is likely to reflect employment patterns on participating farms and the nature of the potential work lost, but is not testable. Finally, Tir Mynydd seems to have safeguarded female employment. However, this may mean that, with the support of the scheme, there is sufficient work for a proportion of spouses, but in the absence of the scheme the expectation is that the need for this work will be removed. This is perhaps slightly different from a situation where jobs are lost, although again this is not testable.
12. In Axis 3 there have been targets set for approved projects for participation by men and women in different Measures. For example for Measure 312 micro enterprises, targets have been set for potentially disadvantaged groups in projects approved in Business Plan Round 1. In this sense equal opportunities have been mainstreamed. It is too early for there to be much information of actual participation by men and women.

Table 0-1: Numbers of potentially disadvantaged groups set as targets for participation in Business Plan Round 1 approved projects for Measure 312

Indicators - numbers participating in the projects	Total targets in Business Plan Round 1 Projects
Number of women	669
Number of black and minority ethnic groups	50
Number of Welsh speakers	608
Number of elderly people	394
Number of individuals from under employed groups	77

Source: Offer letter Annex B targets supplied by Welsh Assembly Government to the evaluators.

13. In summary, there is no evidence to suggest that the RDP does not provide equal gender opportunities in terms of the direct receipt of support, although there is some evidence that, at least in terms of employment creation/protection, males benefit more than females. However, the pattern is complex and no conclusion of systematic bias can be drawn.

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd E&S(4)-08-11 : Papur 8

Blaenraglen Waith y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd – Tymor yr Hydref 2011

Diben

1. Mae'r papur hwn yn gwahodd Aelodau i nodi amserlen y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd sydd ynghlwm yn atodiad A.

Cefndir

2. Yn atodiad A, ceir copi o amserlen y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd.

Argymhelliad

3. Bod y Pwyllgor yn nodi'r rhaglen waith sydd ynghlwm yn atodiad A.

Gwasanaeth y Pwyllgorau

Atodiad A

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd

Yr amserlen waith – tymor yr hydref, 2011

Tudalen 59

	Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd	Grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin	Grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar y Polisi Pysgodfeydd Cyffredin
Dydd Iau 3 Tachwedd 9.00 - 12.00	<p>Clywed tystiolaeth lafar mewn perthynas â'r ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swalec / SSE • Scottish Power • RWEpower • Y Grid Cenedlaethol 		
Dydd Iau 3 Tachwedd 13.00 - 15.00			<p>Clywed tystiolaeth lafar ar y Polisi Pysgodfeydd Cyffredin</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cyngor Cefngwlad Cymru • Cyswllt Amgylchedd Cymru • Y Dirprwy Weinidog
Dydd Mercher 9 Tachwedd 9.00 - 12.00		<p>Clywed tystiolaeth lafar ar y Polisi Amaethyddol</p>	

		Cyffredin <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Y Dirprwy Weinidog • Y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd – Cyfarwyddiaeth Gyffredinol Amaethyddiaeth 	
Dydd Iau 17 Tachwedd 9.00 – 12.00			Clywed tystiolaeth lafar ar y Polisi Pysgodfeydd Cyffredin <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tystion i'w gadarnhau
Dydd Iau 17 Tachwedd 13.00 – 15.00		Clywed tystiolaeth lafar ar y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru • Cyngor Cefngwlad Cymru • Yr Ymddiriolaeth Genedlaethol (i'w gadarnhau) • RSPB • Cyswllt Amgylchedd Cymru • Y Grŵp Cyngori ar Ffermio a Bywyd Gwylt 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cymdeithas y Pridd 	
Dydd Mercher 23 Tachwedd 9.00 - 12.00	Clywed tystiolaeth lafar mewn perthynas â'r ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cyngor Cefngwlad Cymru • Tystion i'w gadarnhau 		
Dydd Llun 28 Tachwedd (Ffair Aeaf Brenhinol Cymru)		Clywed tystiolaeth lafar ar y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NFU Cymru • Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru • Cymdeithas Tir a Busnes Cefn Gwlad • Y Ffermwyr Ifanc • Ffermwyr Dyfodol Cymru 	
Dydd Iau 1 Rhagfyr 09.00 - 12.00	Clywed tystiolaeth lafar mewn perthynas â'r ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RenewableUK Cymru • West Coast Energy 		
Dydd Iau 1 Rhagfyr 13.00 - 15.00	Clywed tystiolaeth lafar mewn perthynas â'r ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni		

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Tystion i'w gadarnhau		
Dydd Mercher 7 Rhagfyr 9.00 - 12.00	Clywed tystiolaeth lafar mewn perthynas â'r ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni Y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin - cytuno ar yr adroddiad / llythyr dros dro		